



This project is co-funded by the Justice Programme of the European Union



*Workstream 1*

*D.1.2*

# Legal Clinic Report

## Development and current state of Transcultural Legal Clinics

Project title: TransLaw – Exploring Legal Interpreting Service Paths and Transcultural Law Clinics for persons suspected or accused of crime

Grant Agreement number: 760157 — TransLaw — JUST-AG-2016/JUST-AG-2016-06

Edited by: Sylvi Rennert, Christina Weißenböck

Authors: Katalin Balogh, Isabelle Bambust, Caterina Falbo, Natalia Kaloh Vid, Vlasta Kučič, Sylvi Rennert, Heidi Salaets, Maurizio Viezzi, Christina Weißenböck

Contributors: Mitja Gialuz, Fabio Spitaleri, Evert-Jan van der Vlis

Place: Vienna, University of Vienna

Date: September 2018

The content of this report represents the views of the authors only and is their sole responsibility. The European Commission does not accept any responsibility for use that may be made of the information it contains.

# Content

<b>1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1	Definitions .....	1
1.2	The need for transcultural law clinics .....	3
1.2.1	Training.....	3
1.2.2	Access to justice .....	4
<b>2</b>	<b>HISTORY OF LAW CLINICS</b> .....	<b>5</b>
2.1	The global clinical movement .....	5
2.2	Law clinics in Europe.....	6
<b>3</b>	<b>LAW CLINICS IN THE PARTNER COUNTRIES</b> .....	<b>9</b>
3.1	History and situation of law clinics in Austria, Germany, and Switzerland .....	9
3.1.1	History of law clinics in Austria.....	9
3.1.2	History of law clinics in Germany and Switzerland.....	10
3.1.3	Current law clinics in Austria .....	10
3.1.4	Current law clinics in Germany and Switzerland .....	11
3.1.5	Extramural legal aid services in Austria for criminal law and/or with interpreting services .....	13
3.2	History and situation of law clinics in Italy.....	14
3.2.1	History of law clinics in Italy .....	14
3.2.2	Current law clinics in Italy.....	14
3.2.3	Extramural legal aid services in Italy for criminal law and/or with interpreting services.....	16
3.3	History and situation of law clinics in Slovenia .....	17
3.3.1	History of law clinics in Slovenia.....	17
3.3.2	Current law clinics in Slovenia .....	17
3.3.3	Extramural legal aid services in Slovenia for criminal law and/or with interpreting services .....	18
3.4	History and situation of law clinics in Belgium and the Netherlands.....	19
3.4.1	History of law clinics in Belgium and the Netherlands .....	19
3.4.2	Current law clinics in Belgium.....	20
3.4.3	Current law clinics in the Netherlands .....	21
3.4.4	Extramural legal aid services in Belgium and the Netherlands for criminal law and/or with interpreting services .....	23

<b>4</b>	<b>CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>REFERENCES.....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>6</b>	<b>ANNEX.....</b>	<b>31</b>

# 1 Introduction

Sylvi Rennert

The JUST-AG-2016 project *TransLaw – Exploring Legal Interpreting Service Paths and Transcultural Law Clinics for persons suspected or accused of crime* aims to establish transcultural law clinics at the Universities of Leuven, Maribor, Trieste, and Vienna. As a first step, this report describes the history and status quo of (transcultural) law clinics and explores the integration of legal interpreters into university law clinics.

Following the definition of the key concepts in the following sections, Chapter 2 provides a history of law clinics from their beginnings in the United States to their worldwide spread, with a special focus on their – comparatively recent – spread to Europe. This is followed in Chapter 3 by country reports assembled by the four project partners, describing the stage of development of (transcultural) law clinics in each country or language area and providing an overview of current services. A list of all relevant law clinics is provided in the Annex.

While our focus is on transcultural criminal law clinics, the report paints a broader picture of the law clinic/legal aid landscape, including not only transcultural law clinics and clinics focusing on criminal law, but also law clinics specialising in other legal fields, law clinics providing multilingual information through multilingual advisors or lay interpreters, and other non-profit organisations that are not law clinics but provide legal aid in more than one language and/or in the field of criminal law.

## 1.1 Definitions

The European Network of Clinical Legal Education (ENCLE) provides the following definition of clinical legal education:

*Clinical legal education is a legal teaching method based on experiential learning, which fosters the growth of knowledge, personal skills and values as well as promoting social justice at the same time. As a broad term, it encompasses varieties of formal, non-formal and informal educational programs and projects, which use practical-oriented, student-centered, problem-based, interactive learning methods, including, but not limited to, the practical work of students on real cases and social issues supervised by academics and professionals. These educational activities aim to develop professional attitudes, and foster the growth of the practical skills of students with regard to the modern understanding of the role of the socially oriented professional in promoting the rule of law, providing access to justice and peaceful conflict resolutions, and solving social problems.<sup>1</sup>*

As this definition indicates, clinical legal education is anything but uniform. It includes both field placements and law clinics, and even the latter, which are the focus of this project, differ considerably in their organisational setup, scope, target groups, and many other factors. These differences may be due to the legal situation in the country or state in question, law school curricula, or the needs of the population they are intended to serve.

While clinical legal education is very much formalised in the US, where 33% of law schools require or guarantee student enrolment in a clinical course, and the range of students participating in such a

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://encle.org/about-encle/definition-of-a-legal-clinic> (last accessed 12 February 2018)

programme before graduation in general is 46–50% (Kuehn, & Santacroce, 2017, p. 11), the situation is very different in many European countries, where law clinics are a relatively recent phenomenon and are often not part of the curriculum (cf. Hannemann & Dietlein, 2016). Most European law clinics also operate with a very low budget (Bartoli, 2016, pp. 48ff.) and are not always formally part of the university: In Poland, law clinics may be student-run projects, organised by the faculty and formally part of the university, or organised as associations or foundations (Sakowicz, 2005, p. 52). In Austria, the Vienna Law Clinics, though closely linked to the University of Vienna, are formally organised as an association<sup>2</sup>.

The scope is very different as well: In the US, law students may represent their clients in court with a supervising lawyer under the Student Practice Rules<sup>3</sup> (Hannemann & Dietlein, 2016, pp. 46f.), while in Germany, it only became possible to set up law clinics with the 2008 amendment to the Legal Services Act (*Rechtsdienstleistungsgesetz*), which regulates the provision of legal services by non-lawyers. Such services have to be provided free of cost (Hannemann & Dietlein, 2016, p. 2) and supervised by a lawyer (ibid, 10).

Law clinic services are generally provided pro bono, but while some law clinics are open to everyone, others may only accept clients who meet certain criteria, e.g. are indigent, poor, or belong to a certain population group.

Perhaps the only two factors that are common to all law clinics are that they provide practical legal education and legal aid (cf. Winkler, 2012, p. 4). Nwedu (2017) argues that the element of providing legal aid to underserved parts of the population in particular is intrinsic to clinical legal education, and Bloch (2008, p. 111) writes that “access to justice is widely accepted as a central component of clinical legal education in the United States and in many other countries around the world”. As Bartoli (2016, p. 22) finds, “the different definitions agree that the legal clinic programs have a dual nature (educational and pro-social) and a dual beneficiary (students and clients)”.

Law clinics are neither the only kind of clinical legal education nor the only form of pro bono student activities, which also include legal literacy efforts, awareness-raising programmes, assistance with income tax forms, or mediation<sup>4</sup>. Other non-governmental organisations may provide legal aid similar to that provided in law clinics, but lack the aspect of legal training.

For the purpose of this document, law clinic shall be broadly defined as an education programme that combines the elements of legal aid and practical legal training. Although not necessarily physically located at the university, a law clinic is in some way tied to the university or law school, and students are supervised by a faculty member or legal expert. The terms *law clinic* and *legal clinic* are used synonymously in the literature and in this document.

---

<sup>2</sup> <https://vlc.univie.ac.at/> (last accessed 12 February 2018)

<sup>3</sup> For details, see <http://www.law.georgetown.edu/library/research/guides/studentpractice.cfm> (last accessed 12 February 2018)

<sup>4</sup> For an overview of all US student-run law school public interest and pro bono programmes, see [https://www.americanbar.org/groups/probono\\_public\\_service/resources/directory\\_of\\_law\\_school\\_public\\_interest\\_pro\\_bono\\_programs/definitions/pb\\_student.html](https://www.americanbar.org/groups/probono_public_service/resources/directory_of_law_school_public_interest_pro_bono_programs/definitions/pb_student.html) (last accessed 12 February 2018)

## 1.2 The need for transcultural law clinics

As we have seen in the previous section, law clinics fulfil a number of functions. This section looks at the two core aspects of law clinics, training and access to justice, and discusses their relevance in the context of the TransLaw project to explain the need for transcultural law clinics.

Analogously to the definition of a law clinic (see above), we define a *transcultural law clinic* as a law clinic that makes pro bono legal aid accessible to people of various cultural, ethnic and linguistic backgrounds, combining the elements of legal aid and practical legal and interpreting training.

For the purpose of this document, the term “transcultural law clinic” shall be reserved for law clinics that provide (student) interpreter-mediated legal aid in keeping with the scope of this project, while “multilingual law clinic” will be used to refer to any other forms of law clinics where legal aid is provided in more than one language; e.g. bilingual law students providing legal aid in both of their languages, speakers of specific languages providing legal aid in those languages, or members of the community or law students acting as lay interpreters.

### 1.2.1 Training

In addition to the practical legal training provided by conventional law clinics, transcultural law clinics also offer practical interpreting training for interpreting students. Practice in real or realistic situations is generally regarded as important in interpreter training and many universities require students to participate in an internship or other form of practical training. Interpreting at a law clinic offers an opportunity for public service or legal interpreting students to work in a setting where their interpretation matters, as opposed to interpreting in mock trials and roleplay exercises at university or observing real trials. Working on real cases, with real clients and law students, allows them to reflect on their role and the ethics and dynamics of such interpreter-mediated interactions, and to acquire a better understanding of law and legal terminology.

Transcultural law clinics offer law students the opportunity to provide legal aid not only to those who speak the country’s official language(s), but also to those who do not have a sufficient command of the language – an often especially underserved and marginalised part of the population. It sensitises them to working with clients who may come from different cultural and geographical backgrounds and from different legal systems. Crucially, it teaches law students how to work with interpreters: addressing the client directly rather than asking the interpreter to ask the client something, waiting for the interpretation to be completed before responding, keeping utterances to a manageable length, providing the interpreter with the material they need to prepare, etc. They also learn what they can and cannot expect from an interpreter, what the code of conduct and ethics of interpreters are, and, hopefully, understand the need for professional interpreters rather than family members or other laypeople even when not in court or in a police interview. (For a thorough discussion of teaching law students to work with interpreters, see McCaffrey, 2000.)

### 1.2.2 Access to justice

Access to justice is considered an intrinsic part of clinical legal education by many (cf. e.g. Bartoli, 2017; Bloch, 2008; Nwedu, 2017; Winkler, 2012). Bartoli (2016, p. 17) argues that it is a way for universities to fulfil their third mission and contribute to social development in keeping with the social dimension goals of the European Higher Education Area.

Law clinics in general provide aid to marginalised and underserved parts of the population who do not have the means to seek other forms of legal aid and often lack the information to do so. Transcultural law clinics expand this population to those who do not speak the official language of the country sufficiently to manage in a legal setting: nationals of other EU member states, immigrants from third countries (including second- and third generation immigrants), and refugees. Despite EU Directive 2010/64/EU on the right to interpretation and translation in criminal proceedings and related directives, interpreting at police interviews and in court is often the bare minimum, and may not be available for conversations with the public defender.

Many law clinics and pro bono legal aid centres recognise the need for interpretation or aid in multiple languages (e.g. bilingual law students providing legal aid in both of their languages, speakers of specific languages providing legal aid in those languages, lay interpreters from the community, or law students acting as lay interpreters). The problem in most cases is that the people providing the pro bono interpreting services lack either legal training, interpreter training, or both, with possibly detrimental consequences for the quality of service. A notable exception is the Language Bank project in Seattle, where law students who speak more than one language are trained by a court interpreter in basic interpreting skills and ethics.<sup>5</sup> They are then registered in a database and assist lawyers taking pro bono cases (cf. Shetty, 2004). While not limited to a law clinic, this is a good example of a functioning multilingual pro bono legal aid service.

Another good example of law clinics recognising the need for interpreters is the General Practice Clinic at Hamline University School of Law in Minnesota, where Angela McCaffrey (2000) prepares students to select and work with interpreters. They learn how to conduct interpreter-mediated interviews, how to determine whether a client needs an interpreter, how to select a suitable interpreter, and how to help them prepare. They also learn what they can and cannot expect from an interpreter, how important cultural background, dialect and nuanced communication can be, and learn to value the difficulty of the interpreter's task. Although McCaffrey advocates the need for such training at other law schools, this does not so far appear to be a common approach, leaving many law clinics with either no way of serving people who do not speak the country's language or with some form of lay interpreting, with no quality control.

Transcultural law clinics address this problem by providing interpreting services by students under supervision of an interpreting trainer or professional, thus allowing both law and interpreting students to help particularly vulnerable people, become sensitised to their needs, and gain empathy and an understanding of the ethics and social responsibility of their respective professions.

---

<sup>5</sup> Information from [https://www.americanbar.org/groups/probono\\_public\\_service/resources/directory\\_of\\_law\\_school\\_public\\_interest\\_pro\\_bono\\_programs/directory/ld98.html](https://www.americanbar.org/groups/probono_public_service/resources/directory_of_law_school_public_interest_pro_bono_programs/directory/ld98.html) (last accessed 12 February 2018)

## 2 History of law clinics

Sylvi Rennert

Law clinics have their roots in the United States. Although there had been calls for clinical legal education to complement theoretical academic education as early as the 1920s, and “a few isolated experiments with law school clinics at Denver, Duke, and Southern California universities during the 1920s and 1930s” (Wizner, 2002, p. 1933), the idea was initially slow to spread. By the end of the 1950s, 35 law schools had some form of “legal aid clinic”, although only in thirteen of them was the clinic located inside the law school (Barry, 2000, p. 10). From the beginning of what has been termed the “first wave” of law clinics, they had the dual objective of providing students with practical experience and furthering access to justice (Barry, 2000, p. 9).

It was not until the late 1960s that the idea received substantial funding. The “second wave” of clinical legal education was in part fuelled by the zeitgeist of the 1960s: the civil rights and women’s rights movements, the protests against the Vietnam War, and demands by students and faculty alike to give legal education relevance by placing it into the service of the poor and marginalised (Barry, 2000, 9; Giddings, 2011, p. 5). At the same time, major financial support was made available for the first time: William Pincus, the Vice-President of the Ford Foundation, initiated the Council of Legal Education and Professional Responsibility (CLEPR). CLEPR offered grants for law schools to establish legal clinics to provide access to legal services for the poor. Schools receiving these start-up grants had to agree to continue them as part of the curriculum when initial funding ran out (Wizner, 2002, p. 1933). Today, nearly all law schools in the US have a clinical legal education programme. In a 2017 survey, 187 out of 201 US law schools responded, reporting a total of 1433 law clinics (Kuehn, & Santacroce 2017, pp. 8f.).

### 2.1 The global clinical movement

In the 1960s and 1970s, law clinics began developing outside the US. Student-driven movements for social justice and legal aid centres laid the foundation for clinical legal education in Australia, Canada and Great Britain. The Ford Foundation supported the establishment of law clinics in southern and eastern African countries, particularly South Africa, Zimbabwe and Tanzania, in the early 1970s, while in western Africa, clinical legal education would not develop until the early 2000s. Despite attempts to establish law clinics in Latin American countries in the 1960s, they did not take hold until the 1990s, and they still face difficulties with regard to recognition within universities (cf. Castro-Buitrago et al., 2011). The first legal clinics in India were established in the 1970s, but in other Asian countries (such as Cambodia, the Philippines, Malaysia, Indonesia, China and Japan), they are a relatively recent phenomenon.

In the 1980s and 1990s, students and teachers involved in clinical legal education in different countries began exchanging experiences and cooperating, leading to the emergence of what has been termed the “global clinical movement”: a movement that not only aims to prepare students for the demands of a globalised world, but is also committed to the global dimension of access to justice (Bloch, 2008).



This ideal is also embodied by the Global Alliance for Justice Education (GAJE), which facilitates communication and collaboration between clinics worldwide, organises conferences, provides educational materials, and encourages discussions in the name of promoting justice through education. A similar role is assumed at the regional level by the Clinical Legal Education Association (CLEA) in the US, the Association of University Legal Aid Institutions (AULAI) in Africa, Bridges Across Borders Southeast Asia Community Legal Education (BABSEA CLE) in Asia, and the European Network for Clinical Legal Education (ENCLE) in Europe.

## 2.2 Law clinics in Europe

Law clinics are relatively recent in most of Europe, with the exception of the UK. They first emerged in Central and Eastern Europe in the latter half of the 1990s in the wake of the massive changes after the fall of the Iron Curtain, when new societal, governmental and legal structures were forming. There was a need for both a form of hands-on legal education that could support the change and a high demand for legal aid. Many of these local efforts received financial support from American organisations, such as the Open Society, leading to the creation of legal clinics in the Czech Republic, Hungary and Poland (Romano, 2016, p. 30f.) as well as Russia and Ukraine (Rekosh, 2005, p. 44). Poland, in particular, has developed a strong tradition of clinical legal education, with 26 law clinics in 15 cities (Hannemann & Dietlein, 2016, p. 49).

Western Europe lagged, and still lags, behind, with the first clinical programmes starting in the 2000s, in part prompted by the Bologna process (Romano 2016: 34). In a survey of European law clinics, Romano (2016, p. 15) found that the vast majority of clinics in the EU were no more than 15 years old, and many were less than five years old. The survey encompasses over 100 clinics, but the author notes that it is not a complete census of all clinical legal programmes. Among the countries with the largest number of clinics are Italy, Poland, Germany and the UK. Most have a very low budget (50% have less than €10,000 a year) and are funded mainly by the university, but this differs even within countries – Poland is the only country with a uniform system. Polish law clinics are centrally coordinated by a consortium and are a fully recognised part of the country’s reform of legal education (Zielinska, 2005, p. 14).

Some possible reasons for the different pace of development of law clinics in (Western) Europe may be due to differences in legal education and the organisation and structure of legal services. Law schools in the US included very little practical training before law clinics were established, and no practical experience is needed to be admitted to the bar exam. Therefore, the introduction of law clinics was a sensible and necessary step to provide students with practical training. In many European countries, in contrast, law school itself is rather theoretical, but compulsory practical training is required after law school (cf. Hannemann & Dietlein, 2016, p. 5, 46) – e.g. five years’ legal professional work, including a minimum of 9 months of clerkship at a court and 3 years at a lawyer’s office to be admitted to the bar exam in Austria<sup>6</sup> or four years of clerkship at a court and an exam to become a judge, or two years of clerkship in five different areas of legal practice before being admitted to the second state

---

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.europaeische-juristenausbildung.de/Laender/oesterreichframe.htm>

exam in Germany, the requirement for becoming a judge or lawyer<sup>7</sup>. As a result, there may not have been as pressing a need in Western Europe for law clinics from the perspective of legal education as in the US.

The second possible factor is the difference in legal systems, the organisation and structure of legal service, and access to justice, especially civil justice. In the US, “fewer than one in five low-income persons in America obtain the legal assistance they need” (Mathews & Botero, 2010, p. 25), and the scores in the World Justice Project’s Rule of Law Index are very low for accessibility and affordability of civil justice. The score for lack of discrimination is also very low for civil justice and even lower for criminal justice (World Justice Project, 2018, p. 153). Providing access to justice played a big part in the development of law clinics in the US, and Western European countries may have seen less need for such aid in the past (although this has changed in recent years). The need for legal aid was certainly a deciding factor in the rapid expansion of law clinics in Central and Eastern Europe after the fall of the Iron Curtain.

However, access to justice differs between European countries as well. The 2018 EU Justice Scoreboard (DG JUST, 2018 p. 23) compares the availability of online information about the judicial system for the general public and finds that although all countries under review (Austria, Belgium, Germany, Italy, the Netherlands, and Slovenia) offer education on legal rights, Austria and Slovenia do not offer targeted information for non-native speakers, while Belgium and the Netherlands do not have a web portal with online forms for the public and companies, and only Italy and the Netherlands provide an interactive online simulation to assess eligibility for legal aid. Of the countries under review, Italy offers information in all six categories (web portal, education, interactive online simulation, targeted information for non-native speakers, for children, and for visually or hearing impaired), while Austria only offers two: education on legal rights and a web portal. There are also enormous differences in legal aid for civil or commercial disputes: In Belgium and the Netherlands, certain categories of people are automatically entitled to legal aid (cf. 3.4), but not all. The income threshold for full legal aid in Belgium is approx. 8% below the Eurostat poverty threshold and in Slovenia it is approx. 4% below, while in Germany and the Netherlands at least partial legal aid is granted for people with an income up to 40% above the poverty threshold. Italy grants full legal aid up to an income threshold of just over 20% above the poverty threshold, and in Austria, legal aid is at the court’s discretion. (DG JUST, 2018, p. 24)

Income thresholds mean that the share of the population theoretically eligible for legal aid varies from country to country. In Belgium, it is between 10 and 20% and in the Netherlands just under 27% (Barendrecht et al., 2014, p. 86)., while in Italy, 2–3% of the Italian population were eligible for legal aid in 2016 (Namoradze 2016). The income threshold for 2018 was € 11,493,82 plus €1,032.91 for each cohabitating relative. Free legal aid is only granted to Italian citizens and to foreign nationals and stateless persons permanently resident in Italy in civil and administrative cases, but not in criminal cases (Canestrini 2017). This leads to further obstacles to receiving legal aid, regardless of income thresholds: For example, persons without a fixed abode may find it difficult to produce the proof required to qualify for legal aid, as in Italy (cf. 3.2.3).

Although in criminal justice, the right to legal aid for “those who lack sufficient resources in so far as such aid is necessary to ensure effective access to justice” is enshrined in Art. 47 of the Charter of

---

<sup>7</sup> [https://www.ibanet.org/PPID/Constituent/Student\\_Committee/qualify\\_lawyer\\_Germany.aspx](https://www.ibanet.org/PPID/Constituent/Student_Committee/qualify_lawyer_Germany.aspx)

Fundamental Rights of the European Union<sup>8</sup>, the extent to which legal aid is provided in criminal proceedings varies. While Belgium and the Netherlands have mandatory representation by a lawyer in most criminal proceedings and, accordingly, provide legal aid for most criminal cases (albeit with the same income thresholds as for civil cases, cf. Barendrecht et al., 2014, p. 35), this is not the case in Germany. Although representation by a lawyer is mandatory and a court-appointed lawyer will be provided if necessary, the cost of the lawyer is considered part of the cost of the proceedings, which must be borne by the defendant if convicted<sup>9</sup>. In Italy, legal aid is available in criminal cases if the defendant meets certain financial criteria, but the UNODC report notes a number of challenges in accessing legal aid, including lack of awareness and a limited number of lawyers to cover legal aid needs (UNODC, 2016, p. 457). Minorities and people who do not know their rights may also experience difficulty accessing legal aid. A Hungarian report found that the notification of defense lawyers before the first interrogation by the authorities was more frequently on very short notice (less than one hour, in multiple cases only three or four minutes) for Roma than for non-Roma suspects, and in two cases of Roma defendants, no defense lawyer was notified at all (Bárdits et al., 2014, pp. 114f.). Of the project countries, both Italy and Slovenia rank below the average for their income group in the Rule of Law Index for all categories of civil and all but one of criminal justice, including accessibility and affordability of civil justice and lack of discrimination (World Justice Project, 2018, p. 98, 135).

Despite the generally easier access to justice in Europe as compared to the United States, there is still a need for the services law clinics can provide, not only in areas such as consumer protection and environmental and business law, but also in the field criminal law.

---

<sup>8</sup> 2012/C 326/02 <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:12012P/TXT>

<sup>9</sup> <https://dejure.org/gesetze/StPO/465.html>

### 3 Law clinics in the partner countries

Following the general introduction to the history of law clinics and the overview of law clinics in Europe provided in the previous chapters, the country reports included in this chapter describe the specific situation in the participating countries: Austria, Belgium, Italy and Slovenia. The section on Austria also includes some information on Germany and the German-speaking part of Switzerland, while the section on Belgium includes information on the Netherlands.

The first part of the country reports looks at the history of law clinics in the country/region. It describes the organisation of law clinics, their target groups and subject areas, and analyses whether they use(d) interpreting services in any way. This part also provides a brief overview of the legal situation for law clinics in the country, such as legislation governing the provision of legal advice by non-lawyers, restrictions on whom law clinics may serve, etc. The second part of each country report documents the state of play, providing facts and figures on current law clinics: their organisation, the area(s) of law they focus on, their target groups, and interpreting services, if any. This is complemented by a brief overview of extramural legal aid offices and NGOs that provide legal consultations and other legal aid services that either deal with criminal law or offer interpreting services in each country.

The information assembled in these country reports describes the starting point for the TransLaw project.

#### 3.1 History and situation of law clinics in Austria, Germany, and Switzerland

Sylvi Rennert, Christina Weißböck

##### 3.1.1 History of law clinics in Austria

Legal clinical education has not been a topic in Austria until recently. This might be due to the well-matured and extensive legal aid system that offers many options free of charge.

In 2001, Wolfgang Benedek initiated a refugee law clinic at the University of Graz; however, the clinic was designed as an introductory course only<sup>10</sup>. The first attempt to establish a legal clinic covering criminal law in Austria was made at the same university in 2005. Richard Soyer was given the new endowed chair for prevention and criminal justice practice, and he started the *Rechtsambulanz*, a legal clinic for prison inmates, in cooperation with two prisons in Graz (Soyer & Hauser, 2007, 2212/AB-XXIV. GP 2009). However, in 2009, the Austrian Ministry of Justice put an end to the project (Simoner, 2009, 2176/J-XXIV. GP 2009, 2212/AB-XXIV. GP 2009). A second attempt to establish a law clinic in Graz was made in the winter semester 2016/2017. There are now two clinics: One offers help in the field of public and environmental law<sup>11</sup>, the other one on issues concerning refugee law<sup>12</sup>.

<sup>10</sup> <https://refugee-law-clinic.uni-graz.at/de/ueber-die-rlc/geschichte/> (last accessed 07 March 2018)

<sup>11</sup> <https://oeffentliches-recht.uni-graz.at/de/praxisprofessuren/eisenberger/legal-clinic/> (last accessed 27 February 2018)

<sup>12</sup> <https://refugee-law-clinic.uni-graz.at/> (last accessed 07 March 2018)

In 2014, two students of the University of Vienna, David Weixlbraun und Felix Kernbichler, initiated the student association *Vienna Law Clinics* (VLC)<sup>13</sup>, offering free legal information (Mathe, 2016). From 2017 on, the law clinics have been managed in cooperation with the Faculty of Law as part of academic teaching (Malle, 2017).

In 2016<sup>14</sup> and 2017<sup>15</sup>, Gregor Heißl organised a refugee law clinic as part of a course at the University of Innsbruck in cooperation with Unabhängige Rechtsberatung (independent legal consultations), a project by Diakonie Flüchtlingsdienst (a Christian social assistance organisation for refugees)<sup>16</sup> (Fessler, 2016, pp. 4f.).

Richard Soyer became professor of Business Criminal Law and Compliance as well as chair of the Department for Corporate Criminal Law and Criminal Law Practice at the University of Linz in 2012. There, he initiated another *Rechtsambulanz* project, this time without cooperation with prisons or legal consultations for prisoners<sup>17</sup>.

### 3.1.2 History of law clinics in Germany and Switzerland

In Germany, the concept of legal clinics has been discussed for the last 150 years (Kilian, 2017, p. 950, Schäpers, 2017, pp. 959f.). However, it took until 2008 before the necessary legal basis for student legal advice was created: the amendment of the Legal Services Act (Rechtsdienstleistungsgesetz – RDG), which allows the provision of free legal services without applying for a permission, under certain conditions and for altruistic reasons (Remmert, 2017, p. 946). In 2012, the Federal Association of Student Legal Advisers (*Bund Studentischer Rechtsberater*<sup>18</sup>, BSRB) was founded to ensure networking and knowledge transfer between the various student counselling centres (Paal, 2017, p. 957). By 2017, more than 60 law clinics had been established in Germany (Kilian & Wenzel, 2017, p. 963).

In Switzerland, there are no regulations concerning legal advice. Anyone is allowed to give legal counsel and may represent themselves in court. Only periodic fee-based representation in civil and criminal proceedings is regulated by the Anwaltsmonopol (lawyer monopoly). Therefore, not many universities have legal clinics. The University of Geneva established one in 2013, and the University of Neuenburg offered its first law clinic in 2016 (Kurt, 2016). In 2017, the University of Bern also launched a law clinic<sup>19</sup>.

### 3.1.3 Current law clinics in Austria

Currently, two universities in Austria offer legal clinics: the University of Vienna and the University of

---

<sup>13</sup> <https://vlc.univie.ac.at/> (last accessed 27 February 2018)

<sup>14</sup> [https://orawww.uibk.ac.at/public/lfuonline\\_lv.details?sem\\_id\\_in=16S&lvnr\\_id\\_in=322070](https://orawww.uibk.ac.at/public/lfuonline_lv.details?sem_id_in=16S&lvnr_id_in=322070) (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>15</sup> [https://lfuonline.uibk.ac.at/public/lfuonline\\_lv.details?sem\\_id\\_in=17S&lvnr\\_id\\_in=322070](https://lfuonline.uibk.ac.at/public/lfuonline_lv.details?sem_id_in=17S&lvnr_id_in=322070) (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>16</sup> <https://diakonie.at/einrichtung/unabhaengige-rechtsberatung-tirol> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>17</sup> [http://www.gutelehre.at/lehre-detail/?tx\\_bmwfwlehre\\_pi1%5Bproject%5D=624](http://www.gutelehre.at/lehre-detail/?tx_bmwfwlehre_pi1%5Bproject%5D=624) (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>18</sup> <http://b-s-r-b.de/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>19</sup> [http://www.krim.unibe.ch/ueber\\_uns/abteilungen/lehrstuhl\\_prof\\_weber/index\\_ger.html](http://www.krim.unibe.ch/ueber_uns/abteilungen/lehrstuhl_prof_weber/index_ger.html) (last accessed 21 March 2018)

Graz. The Johannes Kepler University Linz organises a *Rechtsambulanz*, which provides legal clinical education but no direct legal aid.

The student association Vienna Law Clinics (VLC) organises law clinics at the University of Vienna<sup>20</sup> in three different areas: a refugee law clinic, a start-up clinic, and a consumer law clinic. Only the first deals with criminal law, specifically administrative criminal law. However, this clinic does not provide individual consultations, only workshops. In all three clinics, students have to first complete a course in which experienced practitioners give them a comprehensive overview of the respective area of law. Then, students are allowed to work in the VLC law clinics under the guidance of practitioners. Students can earn up to 18 ECTS credits in their diploma or doctoral studies both for participating in the course and for the advisory activity. None of the three law clinics offers interpreting services, although VLC runs a website with answers to frequently asked questions concerning the Austrian asylum procedure in six languages<sup>21</sup>.

The University of Graz offers a legal clinic for public law and environmental law<sup>22</sup> in cooperation with the Volksanwaltschaft (ombuds office). Launched in autumn 2016, the legal clinic selects one case per year and provides free legal aid, with the requirement that the client cannot afford specialised legal services. A professional lawyer guides a team of selected students. Criminal law is not covered, and no interpreting services are provided. The University of Graz also has a refugee law clinic<sup>23</sup>. In cooperation with law firms and non-governmental organisations, students work on legal cases, draft appeals, and do research on legal issues<sup>24</sup>.

The *Rechtsambulanz* at the Johannes Kepler University Linz<sup>25</sup> is a legal clinical education programme offered as a course. Students do not provide legal aid there, but primarily analyse real files and legal proceedings, and discuss rulings<sup>26</sup>.

### 3.1.4 Current law clinics in Germany and Switzerland

There are currently 64 law clinics operating at or adjacent to German higher education institutions (Kilian & Wenzel, 2017, p. 963). An overview can be found at [www.b-s-r-b.de](http://www.b-s-r-b.de), the website of Bund Studentischer Rechtsberater e. V. (Federal Association of Student Legal Advisers). Kilian & Wenzel (2017, p. 964) show that only 22% of the German law clinics are established permanently at a university. This means that only few law schools include legal clinics in their curricula and give students the possibility to gain ECTS points. Three law clinics only provide simulation, and 52% of all clinics provide specialised legal counsel. Most of them are refugee law clinics – only one simulation course specialises in criminal law (Kilian, & Wenzel, 2017, pp. 963f.). This is due to the special legal provisions concerning

---

<sup>20</sup> <https://vlc.univie.ac.at/> (last accessed 27 February 2018)

<sup>21</sup> <http://www.asyl-faq.at/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>22</sup> <https://oeffentliches-recht.uni-graz.at/de/praxisprofessuren/eisenberger/legal-clinic/> (last accessed 27 February 2018)

<sup>23</sup> <https://refugee-law-clinic.uni-graz.at/> (last accessed 07 March 2018)

<sup>24</sup> <https://refugee-law-clinic.uni-graz.at/de/ueber-die-rlc/> (last accessed 07 March 2018)

<sup>25</sup> [http://www.gutelehre.at/lehre-detail/?tx\\_bmwfwlehre\\_pi1%5Bproject%5D=624](http://www.gutelehre.at/lehre-detail/?tx_bmwfwlehre_pi1%5Bproject%5D=624) (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>26</sup> <https://studienhandbuch.jku.at/88891?id=88891&lang=en>, [https://studienhandbuch.jku.at/de-tail.php?id=88891\\_2017W](https://studienhandbuch.jku.at/de-tail.php?id=88891_2017W) (last accessed 21 March 2018)

criminal proceedings in Germany that exclude counselling in criminal law matters (Vogler, 2014, p. 19, Georgescu, 2015, p. 128).

There are some courses that are called “law clinics” but are set up as workshops or internships rather than legal counselling by students in the strictest sense. This is the case at the Freie Universität Berlin<sup>27</sup> or at the Universität Göttingen<sup>28</sup>, for example, which cover criminal law. At some universities, there are legal counsel organisations that are not called “legal clinic” or “law clinic”, even though they provide legal consultations by students (e.g. Law & Legal Studentische Rechtsberatung e. V.<sup>29</sup> works at six universities, criminal law is not included). Furthermore, some law clinics are not accessible to the population at large, but only to people studying at the university in question (e.g. Leibniz Universität Hannover<sup>30</sup>).

Translation/interpretation services are offered at the Bucerius Law School law clinic<sup>31</sup>; however, they are not provided by professionals or translation/interpreting students, but by international and exchange law students. Therefore, there is no professional interpreting, and the service cannot be provided consistently or in all required languages at all times. The law clinic at the Universität Kiel<sup>32</sup> works with professional interpreters, but not on a permanent basis. Many refugee law clinics offer interpretation services: For example, the student-initiated refugee law clinic at the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München<sup>33</sup>, connected to the university through a training programme, offers an interpreting service called *TranslAid*<sup>34</sup> aimed at building a cooperation network to improve interpreting services for non-profit organisations. Some other refugee law clinics, primarily organised as student associations, work with professional translators/interpreters, but not on a regular basis (e.g. *Refugee Law Clinic Düsseldorf e. V.*<sup>35</sup>), while other refugee law clinics work with non-professional volunteers (e.g. *Goethe-Uni Law Clinic* at the Goethe-Universität Frankfurt am Main<sup>36</sup>). The *Law Clinic Augsburg*<sup>37</sup> works with translators/interpreters and offers them training in asylum law and legal terminology at the *Language Clinic*<sup>38</sup>.

In Switzerland, some universities offer legal clinics: the University of Bern<sup>39</sup>, the University of Geneva and the University of Neuenburg (Kurt, 2016). At the University of Geneva<sup>40</sup>, four different clinics exist: *TradeLab International Economic Law Clinic, LL.M. International Law Clinic, Migrants’ Rights Law Clinic*, and the *Legal Issues in International Organizations Clinic*. The University of Bern offers a *Human Rights*

---

<sup>27</sup> <http://www.jura.fu-berlin.de/studium/lawclinic/index.html> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>28</sup> <http://www.department-ambos.uni-goettingen.de/index.php/home/126-abteilung?start=10> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>29</sup> <https://lawandlegal.de/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>30</sup> <https://www.jura.uni-hannover.de/legalclinic> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>31</sup> <https://www.law-school.de/lawclinic/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>32</sup> <http://law-clinic-kiel.de/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>33</sup> <http://rlcm.de/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>34</sup> <http://rlcm.de/index.php/uber-uns/translaid/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>35</sup> <https://rlc-duesseldorf.de/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>36</sup> [https://www.jura.uni-frankfurt.de/62842079/0\\_Goethe-Uni-Law-Clinic](https://www.jura.uni-frankfurt.de/62842079/0_Goethe-Uni-Law-Clinic) (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>37</sup> <https://lawclinic.jura.uni-augsburg.de/wordpress/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>38</sup> <https://lawclinic.jura.uni-augsburg.de/wordpress/language/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>39</sup> [http://www.krim.unibe.ch/studium/lehrveranstaltungen/law\\_clinic/index\\_ger.html](http://www.krim.unibe.ch/studium/lehrveranstaltungen/law_clinic/index_ger.html) (last accessed 07 March 2018)

<sup>40</sup> <http://graduateinstitute.ch/home/study/academicdepartments/international-law/law-clinics-1.html> (last accessed 07 March 2018)

*Law Clinic*<sup>41</sup>; one topic covered is penitentiary law. The University of Zurich also offers a course called “law clinic”, however, students do not provide legal counsel, but only work with anonymous closed cases<sup>42</sup>.

### 3.1.5 Extramural legal aid services in Austria for criminal law and/or with interpreting services

Even though free legal counsel is not enshrined in law in Austria, some public bodies as well as non-governmental institutions provide advice or aid concerning criminal law issues.

The Austrian Federal Ministry for Digital and Economic Affairs offers an overview of legal advice and aid services provided in Austria that are free of charge on the website [www.help.gv.at](http://www.help.gv.at); they are listed below. There is no information available on whether they also offer interpreting services.

- *Justiz-Servicecenter* (judicial service centres) are set up at some regional courts in Vienna, Graz, Linz and Innsbruck. They provide help with orientation in the legal system and simple services, like recording of simple applications, land register and company excerpts, etc.
- *Justiz-Ombudsstelle* (judicial ombudsman offices) provide help with questions related to court processes, explaining judicial procedures and decisions. The offices are located at the higher regional courts and are composed of experienced judges.
- *Verteidigernotruf zum rechtsanwaltlichen Bereitschaftsdienst für festgenommene Beschuldigte*, a 24/7 helpline for arrested suspects, is provided by the *Österreichischer Rechtsanwaltskammertag* (ÖRAK), the Austrian Bar Association, in cooperation with the Federal Ministry of Justice. They offer a one-time free telephone consultation.
- A similar service provided by the Bar Association is the *Erste Anwaltliche Auskunft*, a one-time free legal information service by lawyers.
- *Amtstage* (office days) are held on certain days at the district and regional courts in labour and social legal matters or at the Vienna Labour and Social Court. Legal advice is given by judges if the matter is related to an ongoing legal process or if future legal actions are already planned. Oral complaints, requests and statements can be recorded.

There are also a few NGOs and associations that provide advice or aid in the field of criminal law. The association *Legal Literacy Project*<sup>43</sup> is an NGO dedicated to spreading legal knowledge (“legal literacy”) in society. This Viennese NGO was founded and is run by law students. They organise interactive workshops on concrete legal topics, including criminal law, primarily at schools (ages 14 to 19). Furthermore, the organisation *Solidaritätsgruppe*<sup>44</sup> (solidarity group) provides legal consultations and help with simple administrative penalty proceedings.

In Austria, interpretation during criminal law proceedings is guaranteed by law (§ 56 StPO). However,

---

<sup>41</sup> [http://www.krim.unibe.ch/studium/lehrveranstaltungen/law\\_clinic/index\\_ger.html](http://www.krim.unibe.ch/studium/lehrveranstaltungen/law_clinic/index_ger.html) (last accessed 07 March 2018)

<sup>42</sup> <https://www.rwi.uzh.ch/de/lehreforschung/alphabetisch/tag/LehreStudium/lv/Herbstsemester-2017/Law-Clinic.html> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>43</sup> <http://www.vllp.org/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>44</sup> <https://www.solidaritaetsgruppe.org/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)



there are no regulations concerning the provision of translation or interpretation outside those proceedings or in other areas of law.

A number of NGOs and associations provide translation and interpretation services. For example, the VLC does not include an interpretation service, but offers an online platform that provides help with questions related to the asylum procedure in six different languages (German, English, Farsi, Somali, Pashto, and Arabic)<sup>45</sup>. Many NGOs and associations provide free legal counsel and help for migrants, refugees and asylum seekers using interpretation services (e.g., Asyl in Not<sup>46</sup>, ARGE Rechtsberatung/Diakonie Flüchtlingsdienst/Volkshilfe Oberösterreich<sup>47</sup>, Caritas<sup>48</sup>, Verein Menschenrechte<sup>49</sup>).

## 3.2 History and situation of law clinics in Italy

Caterina Falbo, Maurizio Viezzi

### 3.2.1 History of law clinics in Italy

The first law clinic in Italy was set up at the University of Brescia in 2009/10 and was designed with the assistance of several US law clinics. Other law clinics followed in Rome, Turin, and, a few years later, in Bergamo, Teramo, Perugia, and Verona. A special case is *L'altro diritto*, a research and documentation centre set up at the University of Florence in 1996, which operated as an informal law clinic for over 15 years before finally acquiring official law clinic status. *L'altro diritto* has played an important role in Italy's clinical education movement (Bartoli, 2015, pp. 2f.) and covers areas such as protection of human rights and legal aid for detainees, migrants, refugees, and Roma communities.

The development of the law clinic movement in Italy seems to respond to the need felt by some scholars to find new ways to approach and teach law based on a "more realistic, critical and socially committed conception of law" (Bartoli, 2015, p. 2).

### 3.2.2 Current law clinics in Italy

There are considerable variations in the way law clinics in Italy are organised. There are no specific laws governing their activities and each university has to find ways to integrate them into their curricula. At one end of the spectrum, law clinics may take the form of short seminars (eight or ten hours), at the other, they may last several months and include the provision of services. Five main types can be identified:

1. Law clinic with an external desk or contact point: Students provide legal aid or information at a desk located outside the university, generally at a partner organisation.

---

<sup>45</sup> <http://www.asyl-faq.at/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>46</sup> <https://www.asyl-in-not.org/> (last accessed 21 March 2018)

<sup>47</sup> <http://www.arge-rechtsberatung.at/>, <https://fluechtlingsdienst.diakonie.at/einrichtung/arge-rechtsberatung-regionalstelle-wien-und-oesterreichweite-koordination>, <https://www.volkshilfe-ooe.at/die-volkshilfe/stuetzpunkte-bereiche/fluechtlings-und-migrantinnenbetreuung/> (last accessed 07 March 2018)

<sup>48</sup> <https://www.caritas-wien.at/hilfe-angebote/asyl-integration/beratung-fuer-fluechtlinge/asylrechtsberatung/> (last accessed 07 March 2018)

<sup>49</sup> <http://www.verein-menschenrechte.at/> (last accessed 07 March 2018)

2. Law clinic with an internal desk or contact point: Students provide legal aid or information at an open desk located inside the university.
3. Law clinic with no desk or contact point: People in need of legal aid or support or their cases are introduced to students by partner organisations.
4. Law clinic with external dissemination activities: Students go to schools, associations and aid centres, and give lectures on rights protection.
5. Street law clinic: Students operate directly in the community.

Law clinics cover a wide range of areas, with migration and asylum, prison, antidiscrimination and human rights being the most prominent. The main target groups are indigent and marginalised persons, prisoners, migrants, Roma communities, asylum seekers, and refugees, as well as organisations and associations operating in the fields of human rights and the environment. Criminal law is also covered, though to a lesser extent. It should be noted here that the practice of law is only open to members of the Bar and, in some cases, to graduates who have undergone professional training. Students therefore have a rather limited scope of action, always outside the courtroom and always under a qualified legal professional.

There are over thirty law clinics currently active in Italy (see appendix). Of these, a few are worth mentioning here, as they cover areas that are relevant to the TransLaw project.

*Clinica legale I* and *Clinica legale II*, at the University of Brescia<sup>50</sup>, cover a very wide area, from civil law to international law to criminal law. Their target groups are socially disadvantaged persons, non-profit organisations, trade unions, social cooperatives, etc.

*La protezione dei diritti delle persone in esecuzione penale* is a law clinic at the University of Florence<sup>51</sup> which requires students to work with and for prisoners. Together with the two other law clinics operating at the same University, it is run by the School of Law in cooperation with the above-mentioned *L'altro diritto*.

Prison work is also the main focus of other law clinics: *Clinica legale penitenziaria*, at the University of Perugia<sup>52</sup>, requires students to meet prisoners and answer their questions; at *Clinica Carcere e diritti 1*<sup>53</sup>, at the University of Turin, students design social reintegration plans for prisoners and former prisoners, support organisations dealing with persons who have been victims of trafficking, and cooperate with the association *Avvocato di strada onlus* (see 3.2.3). At *Clinica Carcere e diritti 2*<sup>54</sup>, at the same university, students continue the work initiated in 2016/17 to improve the conditions of female prisoners, and present, disseminate and monitor the use of the *Guide to Prisoners' Rights*.

The *Refugee Law Clinic* at the University of Trieste<sup>55</sup> seems to be the only law clinic open to both law students and interpreting students. It has been active since October 2017 and is divided into three

---

<sup>50</sup> <http://clinicalegale.unibs.it/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>51</sup> <https://www.giurisprudenza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>52</sup> <http://www.giurisprudenza.unipg.it/didattica/cliniche-legali/sportello-in-carcere> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>53</sup> [http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=carcere\\_e\\_diritti/attivita.html](http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=carcere_e_diritti/attivita.html) (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>54</sup> [http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=carcere\\_e\\_diritti\\_2/attivita.html](http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=carcere_e_diritti_2/attivita.html) (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>55</sup> <https://iuslit.units.it/sites/iuslit.units.it/files/Refugee%20Law%20Clinic%20-%20descrizione%20DEF2.pdf>, <https://de-de.facebook.com/rlcTS/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

parts: (a) workshops on international refugee protection, asylum systems and legal writing (40 hours), (b) an internship at the *Italian Consortium of Solidarity – ICS onlus di Trieste* (160 hours), and (c) final workshops devoted to debriefing and assessment. A selection process is used for admission and students gain nine ECTS points.

The *Italy Innocence Project* (IIP)<sup>56</sup> has been part of the *Innocence Network* (IN)<sup>57</sup> since 2014. It is hosted by the Law Department at the University of Roma Tre and directed by Luca Lupária. Its activity is three-fold: (a) promoting research on wrongful convictions and miscarriages of justice in Italy and in Europe, (b) analysing individual cases of potentially wrongful convictions with lawyers providing pro bono legal aid, and (c) fostering practical legal education of students through the analysis of real cases (Lupária, n. d.). The IIP may be regarded as a special kind of law clinic where various goals are pursued through activities carried out by a number of actors, including law students. IIP is a good example of fruitful collaboration between different stakeholders with a tangible impact on justice, society, and people's lives.

Further law clinics dealing with criminal matters are active at the Università degli Studi di Milano Bicocca<sup>58</sup>, at the Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Milan<sup>59</sup>, and at the University of Verona<sup>60</sup>.

### 3.2.3 Extramural legal aid services in Italy for criminal law and/or with interpreting services

A number of organisations and associations provide free legal aid and advice. The best known is *Avvocato di strada* (ADS)<sup>61</sup>, a non-profit organisation founded in Bologna in 2000 and currently operating in 49 cities and towns where it provides free legal aid and advice to persons with no fixed abode. It should be noted that persons with an annual family income lower than € 11,493.82 plus € 1,032.91 per each cohabiting relative are entitled to free legal aid under Italian law. Appropriate proof of income is required; however, which persons with no fixed abode are often unable to produce, thus missing the opportunity to benefit from free legal aid. ADS provides free legal aid and advice to all persons with no fixed abode irrespective of their income, and therefore irrespective of their being officially entitled to free legal services. Potential recipients of free legal services are identified by associations helping indigent or marginalised persons and by members of ADS working at homeless shelters. Professional interpreting services are not provided. People who cannot speak Italian are often helped by their compatriots with sufficient command of Italian.

---

<sup>56</sup> <http://italyinnocenceproject.org/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>57</sup> <http://innocencenetwork.org/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>58</sup> <https://www.giurisprudenza.unimib.it/it/eventi/clinica-legale-materia-penale-aa-2017-2018> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>59</sup> <http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>60</sup> <http://www.dsg.univr.it/?ent=avviso&dest=&id=128545&lang=it> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>61</sup> <http://www.avvocatodistrada.it/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

### 3.3 History and situation of law clinics in Slovenia

Natalia Kaloh Vid, Vlasta Kučič

#### 3.3.1 History of law clinics in Slovenia

Slovenia has traditionally been a transit country for migration – in 2016, migrants amounted to 6.6% of Slovene population (24,687 citizens of European Union Member States and European Economic Area states and 110,849 third-country nationals held a valid residence permit in Slovenia)<sup>62</sup>. However, the history of law clinics in the country is relatively recent. It began only in 2000, when the *Legal Clinic for Migrants and Refugees* was established at the Faculty of Law of the University of Ljubljana. It should be clarified that pro bono legal advice has been traditionally offered by various governmental (e.g. at the Supreme Court) and non-governmental organisations (e.g. PIC), and the right to “court protection” (*sodno varstvo*) is defined in Art. 25 of the Slovenian Constitution<sup>63</sup>. However, law clinics, as defined in scientific literature and implied in practice, are a relatively new form of offering pro bono legal aid in Slovenia.

#### 3.3.2 Current law clinics in Slovenia

Legal clinics that have recently been opened in South-East Europe include those in Croatia (Zagreb, Osijek, Rijeka), in Macedonia (Skopje), in Montenegro (Podgorica), and in Serbia (Beograd, Niš and Novi Sad).

To provide an opportunity for law students, as future legal professionals, to strengthen their knowledge and gain practical insight, the *Legal Clinic for Migrants and Refugees (Pravna klinika za begunce in tujce)*<sup>64</sup> was established in 2000 as an extracurricular activity at the Faculty of Law of the University of Ljubljana, in cooperation with PIC (Legal-Informational Centre for NGOs – *Pravno-informacijski center nevladnih organizacij*, cf. 3.3.3)<sup>65</sup> as a mentor organisation. PIC also serves as a partner/mentor organisation for two other legal clinics established at the Faculty of Law of the University of Ljubljana: the *Legal Clinic for Environmental Protection (Pravna klinika za varstvo okolja)*<sup>66</sup> and the *Legal Counselling for Protection against Discrimination (Pravna svetovalnica za varstvo pred diskriminacijo)*<sup>67</sup>.

The *Legal Clinic for Migrants and Refugees* instructs law students in the field of international protection procedure; therefore, its activities are aimed at asylum seekers. Students participating in the legal clinic obtain in-depth knowledge of asylum legislation and asylum procedure in Slovenia and offer legal assistance to refugees and other migrants. Each year, approximately 10–15 senior year students take part in the programme, benefiting from introductory seminars held by practitioners from the field and

---

<sup>62</sup> Information from: Ministry of Interior <http://www.mnz.gov.si> (last accessed 16 March 2018)

<sup>63</sup> Odločba Ustavnega sodišča RS, št. U-I-161/12, točka 15

<sup>64</sup> <http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-klinika-za-begunce-in-tujce/> (last accessed 16 March 2018)

<sup>65</sup> <http://www.pic.si> (last accessed 16 March 2018)

<sup>66</sup> <http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-klinika-za-varstvo-okolja/> (last accessed 16 March 2018)

<sup>67</sup> <http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-svetovalnica-za-varstvo-pred-diskriminacijo/> (last accessed 16 March 2018)

from the opportunity to get involved in the daily work of one of the partner institutions of the legal clinic. All students who are in at least the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of study at the Faculty of Law can apply. A knowledge of English (and ideally other languages) and good communication skills are required. The selection procedure usually involves both a written application and a personal interview. If more students apply than there are places available, a preliminary selection is made after the interview, taking the following criteria into account: motivation, average grade, foreign language skills, choice of the appropriate study course, previous experience, and the candidate's adequacy according to their personal interview.

There is also a law clinic *Law in Sport*<sup>68</sup> registered as an extracurricular activity at the Faculty of Law of the University of Ljubljana.

Apart from these, the subject *Law Clinic* was introduced as part of the curriculum (before the Bologna reform) at the Faculty of Law of the University of Maribor. Supervised students provided pro bono legal advice for the PIP Institute (*Pravo, Informacija, Pomoč* – Law, Information, Help), which took full responsibility for the legal advice given.

With the Bologna reform and the new accreditation of the study program, the subject *Legal Clinic* was replaced by *Legal Methods, Skills and Informatics* at the University of Maribor, for which students receive ECTS credits. Law students conduct case study-based clinical work which is carried out in cooperation with the project *The Law for All*<sup>69</sup>, organised as an online platform. Hence, the Faculty of Law also offers an opportunity for direct contact with clients. When we asked for information about the practical work, we were told that the clinic provides pro bono legal help mostly for Slovenian citizens. The website of *The Law for All* is only in Slovenian and there is no multilingual information. We were also informed that (a) they had never needed to provide free legal advice to refugees or migrants suspected or accused of crime, (b) cases where they provided services in other languages are extremely rare and translation/interpreting help was always provided by one of the members.

Currently, there is no legal clinic with translation or interpreting services registered as an intracurricular or extracurricular activity at the University of Maribor.

Regardless of the setup of a law clinic, students are not allowed to offer interpreting or translating service in court. This may only be done by court interpreters<sup>70</sup>.

### 3.3.3 Extramural legal aid services in Slovenia for criminal law and/or with interpreting services

Migrants who apply for international protection in Slovenia are provided free legal counselling and legal representation for the international protection procedure. The service, funded by the Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund and the Ministry of the Interior, is provided by PIC (project-based cooperation). Interpretation during procedures (e.g. interviews) is provided by the Ministry of the Interior or by PIC (for legal counselling sessions and information provision sessions). PIC is a legal centre

---

<sup>68</sup> <http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/en/extracurricular-activities/legal-clinic-law-in-sport/> (last accessed 16 March 2018)

<sup>69</sup> <http://www.pravozavse.si/> (last accessed 16 March 2018)

<sup>70</sup> More information available at (Regulations for the court interpreters): *Pravilnik o sodnih tolmačih*: <http://www.pisrs.si/Pis.web/pregledPredpisa?id=PRAV10034> (last accessed 16 March 2018)

for the protection of human rights and the environment established in 1998. It provides professional legal support to individuals, vulnerable groups and non-governmental organisations in exercising and protecting their rights and strengthening their position in society. Besides providing legal assistance, it is active in advocacy, providing information, training, encouraging civil participation in national and international projects, and involved in policy-making and decision-making processes. PIC provides legal counselling and legal representation for international protection applicants in Slovenia and for migrants in return procedures. PIC was an implementing partner of UNHCR (2008–2016) and UNICEF (2016–2017), and is a member organisation of the European Council on Refugees and Exiles and Eurochild. PIC is a partner/mentor organisation for the *Legal Clinic for Migrants and Refugees*, *Legal Clinic for Environmental Protection*, and *Legal Counselling for Protection against Discrimination*, established at the Faculty of Law of the University of Ljubljana.

Within the projects where they provide legal counselling and representation of asylum seekers and migrants in return procedures, PIC have established cooperation with interpreters speaking the mother tongues of the clients. Those interpreters are under contract with the Ministry of the Interior; some are court interpreters, while others are registered for provision of interpretation services.

Additionally, the Ministry of Justice, under the provisions of the International Protection Act, appoints so-called refugee counsellors, who provide support and legal assistance to asylum seekers in connection with procedures related to international protection at the Administrative Court of the Republic of Slovenia and the Supreme Court of the Republic of Slovenia<sup>71</sup>.

Similar to migrants who apply for international protection, migrants in return procedures are provided free legal counselling and legal representation in the return procedure (for the second-instance procedure).

In general, access to free legal aid is regulated under the Legal Aid Act (*Zakon o brezplačni pravni pomoči*). Access to free legal aid is granted to a person who, depending on their financial position and their family's financial situation, without prejudice to their social status and social status of their family, would not be able to pay the costs of legal proceedings or the costs of providing legal assistance. Under Article 10(2) of the Legal Aid Act, foreigners with a permanent or temporary residence in Slovenia and stateless persons legally residing in Slovenia are entitled to free legal aid if they meet the criteria. A request for free legal aid is usually lodged with the competent district court.

### 3.4 History and situation of law clinics in Belgium and the Netherlands

Heidi Balogh, Isabelle Bambust, Heidi Salaets

#### 3.4.1 History of law clinics in Belgium and the Netherlands

Belgium has no history of law clinics as such, as the first initiatives only began after 2010. In the Netherlands, on the other hand, the history runs parallel to the development of legal clinics in the US, where inspiration for law clinics was found in the “war on poverty” and in the civil rights movement. As Wilson

---

<sup>71</sup> More information at: [http://www.mp.gov.si/fileadmin/mp.gov.si/pageuploads/CIP/2017/SI\\_handbook-on-access-to-justice\\_sl.pdf](http://www.mp.gov.si/fileadmin/mp.gov.si/pageuploads/CIP/2017/SI_handbook-on-access-to-justice_sl.pdf) (last accessed 15 March 2018)

(2017, p. 323) finds, “clinical legal education has been underway in the Netherlands for a long time”.

In the 1960s, critical students in the Netherlands founded *rechtswinkels* (law shops), free legal aid centres, in the poorest neighbourhoods, where anybody could ask questions about legal issues or ask for legal assistance. The first was founded in Tilburg in 1969, and by 1975, there were 90 law shops in the Netherlands (Wilson 2017, p. 323).

In 1970, the students published what was called the “black issue” of their students’ journal *Ars Aequi* entitled: “The bar, a void in legal aid”<sup>72</sup>. As the title indicates, its criticism was mostly addressed to lawyers and the bar, highlighting the fact that services of lawyers were not tailored to ordinary people. According to the students, the bar was too focused on procedures while citizens just needed simple information about their legal status, it lacked expertise in social legal domains such as tenancy, employment, welfare, and immigration law, and the location of most law firms in the richest parts of town provided an additional obstacle to access to justice for people from poorer districts.

A publication by Schuyt and Groenendijk<sup>73</sup> (entitled *De weg naar het recht [The path to Justice]* [1976]) endorsed the criticism expressed in the *Ars Aequi* “black issue”. Their conclusion was that people with low income and a low level of education were hindered by psychological and financial barriers if they wanted to stand up for their rights. Thanks to funding by the Ministry of Justice in 1976, a network of *Bureaus voor rechtshulp* (Offices for legal aid) was built. They specialised in domains of social welfare and had free consulting hours (cf. 3.4.4). At the same time, a kind of “social bar” flourished, run by lawyers who addressed themselves exclusively to the “vulnerable people in society”. These law collectives were active throughout the 1970s and into the 1980s. With the increased provision of legal aid by the government and the national bar, student-run law shops became less frequent, but as of 1991, there were still 70 law shops with 1,600 volunteers, most of whom were students. Although they remained extracurricular in nature, some law schools offered (and still offer) credit for student participation (Wilson, 2017, pp. 324f.).

A legal clinic was opened at the Maastricht law school in 1988, which, according to Wilson (2017, p. 325) “was the closest in design and operation to a ‘traditional’ legal clinic in the United States”. The clinic has since closed down and been replaced by a mediation clinic (cf. 0) (Wilson, 2017, pp. 325f.).

### 3.4.2 Current law clinics in Belgium

There are currently law clinics in four Belgian cities. The Catholic University of Leuven (KU Leuven)<sup>74</sup> offers its LL.M. students a number of legal clinics on EU law (economic, financial, human rights, international relations, and international and European jurisprudence). The clinics are open to LL.M. students and a limited number of professionals (solicitors, European Commission officials and scholars). The guest lecturers include legal practitioners, scholars, and representatives of national and EU institutions. These clinics provide a platform to discuss contemporary issues in small groups and allow students to meet experts in their specialisation.

---

<sup>72</sup> [http://arsaequi.nl/bijzondere/nummer/het\\_zwarte\\_nummer](http://arsaequi.nl/bijzondere/nummer/het_zwarte_nummer) (last accessed 15 March 2018)

<sup>73</sup> [http://www.dbnl.org/tekst/schu069weg01\\_01/](http://www.dbnl.org/tekst/schu069weg01_01/) (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>74</sup> <https://www.law.kuleuven.be/education/clinics/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

At the University of Antwerp<sup>75</sup>, participation in a legal clinic or internship is part of the Master's project for the LL.M. programme. The university partners with various institutions, and students prepare assignments. They receive guidance from a faculty member and a mentor from the partner institution. The legal clinic is done during the first or second semester of the Master's programme, and students must prepare a report on their work<sup>76</sup>.

The University of Brussels offers an *Equality Law Clinic* (ELC)<sup>77</sup>, created in 2014, which is based at the Perelman Centre for Legal Philosophy and the European Law Centre of the University of Brussels. It is open to a selected group of graduate students. It includes clinical courses, seminars and conferences. Students are expected to make "a contribution that can assist affected individuals and/or partner organisations"<sup>78</sup>, ranging from third-party interventions, guides for practitioners, and codes of conduct to country reports and best practice analyses. This year it focuses on research and advocacy on immigration and asylum law, reproductive justice and abortion rights, transgender rights, and disability rights.

There is also the *Human Rights and Migration Law Clinic* at the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University<sup>79</sup>, which has been operating since the academic year 2014/2015. It is part of the LL.M. curriculum and wants to provide Master's students with practical education and fulfil a social justice role. Every year, organisations can submit potential projects, which are then distributed among the students. The students work on these real-life case files themselves, do research, and prepare the final product for the partner. These products can include reports, legal information, brochures for a lay audience, drafts of written submissions to courts, or third-party interventions. They are supervised by four clinicians. In the academic year 2017/2018, the projects focused on academic freedom, anti-discrimination law, and migration law.

### 3.4.3 Current law clinics in the Netherlands

The Netherlands have a number of very diverse clinical models.

Law shops (cf. 3.4.1) continue to operate throughout the Netherlands. According to Wilson (2017, p. 325), at least six law schools (University of Amsterdam, Free University Amsterdam, and the universities of Groningen, Leiden, Maastricht, and Tilburg) give students credit for participating in law shops, while the University of Rotterdam does not give credit but encourages student participation and subsidises three law shops. However, in most cases there does not appear to be an express didactic component in the form of supervision by a faculty member, meaning that they do not match the definition of law clinics used in this report. Nevertheless, we will present one example of such a law shop here

---

<sup>75</sup> <https://www.uantwerpen.be/en/education/education-and-training/master-of-laws/profile/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>76</sup> [https://uahost.uantwerpen.be/helpdesk/ro\\_helpdesk/knowledgebase.php?article=162](https://uahost.uantwerpen.be/helpdesk/ro_helpdesk/knowledgebase.php?article=162) (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>77</sup> <http://www.philodroit.be/-ELC-?lang=en> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>78</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>79</sup> <http://www.hrc.ugent.be/human-rights-and-migration-law-clinic/>, see also <http://www.law.ugent.be/llm/legal-clinic-human-rights> and <http://deredactie.be/cm/vrtnieuws/regio/oostvlaanderen/1.2084319> (last accessed 14 May 2018)



to illustrate their workings: The *Wetwinkel* (law shop)<sup>80</sup> in Amsterdam began in the 1980s to cover the gap between legal issues and people who did not know how to navigate the law. Staffed by law students of the University of Amsterdam, they specialise in rent issues, labour law, consumer rights, administrative law, and other civil issues (contracts etc.). They do not cover criminal law.

Maastricht University<sup>81</sup> has two clinical education programmes that offer real-life practice, reaching out to NGOs who need help in problem solving and community building.

At the *Maastricht Mediation Clinic*<sup>82</sup>, students become mediators-in-training to conduct actual mediations with the guidance of professional mediators.

The *Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Lab*<sup>83</sup> is built around an in-house NGO and currently collaborates with the German start-up Good GmbH. Participating students are exposed to corporate social responsibility in practice and involved in the implementation of the social pledges undertaken by the company. The work includes market research, legal research and interviews.

The University of Amsterdam runs the Amsterdam International Law Clinic<sup>84</sup>, where advanced Master's students advise law firms, government bodies, companies and non-governmental organisations on active legal matters. These include international human rights law, international criminal law, international environmental law or any other field of international law, European law, and private international law. The students are supervised by faculty members from the Departments of Public International Law and European Law, and the Amsterdam Center for International Law.

*Clinic, or Law Incubator*<sup>85</sup>, is offered as an optional course for students in the Master's programme on information law at the University of Amsterdam. It was founded by a lawyer and teacher at the University of Amsterdam in 2008. The participating students help start-ups and individuals with legal issues free of charge, and specialised lawyers oversee the process pro bono. The focus is on information law, especially intellectual property law, telecommunications law, internet and IT law, privacy, and consumer law with regard to distance selling.

The *International Humanitarian Law Clinic (IHL Clinic)* at the University of Leiden<sup>86</sup> allows students to work on research projects of partner institutions in the field, for example national Red Cross societies, NGOs specialised in human rights, government agencies, and other actors in the humanitarian field. On the website, the clinic is described as follows:

*"Topics which might have to be dealt with involve the use of certain methods and means of warfare, questions of humanitarian assistance, possible war crimes in specific conflict areas, as well as recent issues concerning the application and interpretation of international humanitarian law, the Geneva Conventions and their Additional Protocols.*

---

<sup>80</sup> <http://www.wetwinkelamsterdam.nl/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>81</sup> <https://www.maastrichtuniversity.nl/about-um/faculties/law/education/moot-courts-and-clinics/legal-clinics> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>82</sup> <https://www.maastrichtuniversity.nl/about-um/faculties/law/education/moot-courts-and-clinics/clinical-education/maastricht-mediation> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>83</sup> <https://www.maastrichtuniversity.nl/about-um/faculties/law/education/moot-courts-and-clinics/clinical-education/corporate-social> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>84</sup> <http://ailc.uva.nl/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>85</sup> <https://clinic.nl/about-clinic/?lang=en> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>86</sup> <https://studiegids.leidenuniv.nl/courses/show/76761/international-humanitarian-law-clinic> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

*The IHL clinic enables students to learn through experience by applying legal theory to real-world situations and helping the partners to solve legal problems that they are encountering in their work. It also allows students to acquire and develop skills in legal research, critical thinking, legal analysis, and problem solving. Additionally, students improve their proficiency in drafting, writing, oral presentation, communication, organization and interpersonal skills. Students are also confronted with ethics and professional responsibility, which is very valuable in enabling students to put abstract notions into a practical context. The IHL Clinic trains students to investigate relevant issues of procedural and substantive law on the basis of the knowledge gained in previous courses throughout their studies. Students are confronted with difficult real-world situations and legal questions.”<sup>87</sup>*

The Tilburg Law School<sup>88</sup> organises project-based law clinics, which can be taken as elective courses. Students receive six ECTS for participation. Among these clinics was one on asylum seekers in Malta<sup>89</sup>. Commissioned by Rob Visser of EASO (Executive Director at the European Asylum Support Office), law students from Master’s programmes discussed the issue of asylum seekers in Malta. They prepared an analysis of the current situation at the European Asylum Support Office, covering all aspects of law, such as victimology and criminal justice, international business taxation and human rights law.

The Tilburg Institute for Law, Technology and Society (TILT)<sup>90</sup> has been holding law clinics on various topics in cooperation with companies, organisations and other universities since 2014. In each TILT Clinic, four Master’s students work on an assignment commissioned by a company, organisation or administrative body. Past topics included privacy implications of health and lifestyle monitoring wearables, open data, car insurance policies, or advising the European Court of Human Rights.<sup>91</sup>

### 3.4.4 Extramural legal aid services in Belgium and the Netherlands for criminal law and/or with interpreting services

Although far fewer than in the Netherlands, Belgium has a number of law shops. Overall, however, “[i]n Belgium, legal aid was and still is mainly the responsibility of the legal profession” (Gibens, 2006, p. 3) and “[c]ontrary to the expanding organised movements of law students and social advocates in the Netherlands, in Belgium similar movements never succeeded in coordinating their social and legal actions” (Gibens, 2006, p. 8f.). Even “[t]he 1998 Legal Aid Act proved nothing more than an elaborated *judicare* scheme, tailored to the legal profession. The welfare approach stood little chance of making an impact, certainly not after the demise of the law shops.” (Gibens, 2006, p. 15).

However, the Judicial Code provides for various forms of legal assistance and legal aid. *Primary legal assistance* encompasses practical and legal information, an initial legal opinion, or a referral, and is available to everyone for a flat-rate fee or, for litigants with low resources, free of charge. *Secondary legal assistance* encompasses a detailed legal opinion and assistance with court action, including legal

---

<sup>87</sup> <https://studiegids.leidenuniv.nl/courses/show/76761/international-humanitarian-law-clinic> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>88</sup> <https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/nl/studenten/studie/aanvullend-onderwijs/law-clinics/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>89</sup> <https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/nl/samenwerken/universiteitsfonds/law-clinic/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>90</sup> <https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/research/institutes-and-research-groups/tilt/education/clinics/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>91</sup> <https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/research/institutes-and-research-groups/tilt/education/clinics/past/> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

representation, which may be provided fully or partly free of charge, and *legal aid* is defined in Belgian law as exemption from various duties and charges related to judicial or extrajudicial proceedings. These forms of support may be granted to all residents of Belgium, including foreign nationals, if their resources are considered insufficient.<sup>92</sup>

The cost of interpretation provided by sworn interpreters in civil and criminal court proceedings is covered by the state (Bambust, Kruger, & Kruger, 2012, p. 222), but the situation is not as clear for legal counsel, as Meurens & Mathieu (2015, p. 7f.) describe:

*If the suspected or accused person in need of interpretation qualifies for legal aid, the legal aid service will assign a legal counsel who speaks the native language of the suspected or accused person, or another language that the person speaks. Therefore, no sworn interpreters will be assigned in this case. If no legal counsel who speaks the person's native language or another language that the person speaks can be assigned, the legal aid service will instead assign an interpreter. However, the legal aid system only covers the services of an interpreter for three hours. Questions have been raised as to whether this time limit is in line with the European Convention of Human Rights.*

In the Netherlands, a large part of legal aid is provided by publicly funded organisations (in addition to the remaining law shops). In 3.4.1 we described how law shops gave rise to institutionalised legal aid. In 2004, the *Bureaus voor rechtshulp* were abolished (due to criticism that some offices offered legal aid to paying clients). To fill this gap, the *Stichting Juridisch loket* (Legal services counters) was founded with 30 locations all over the country. The *Stichting Juridisch loket* is funded by the *Raad voor rechtsbijstand* (Legal aid council), which, in turn, receives some financial support from the Ministry of Justice to finance the Legal services counters. They provide free advice and information for vulnerable people and help them by analysing their legal problem free of charge. Citizens seeking justice can be provided with a “diagnosis document” and referred to a lawyer or a mediator. With this document, the citizen seeking justice can receive a reduction to the income-dependent lawyer’s fee<sup>93</sup>. This is intended to encourage people to use the legal service counter as much as possible to solve legal problems<sup>94</sup>. Interpreting services for the communication between a lawyer and their client are covered by the legal aid council, with no maximum duration<sup>95</sup>. Generally, the lawyer contacts a contracted interpreting agency (TVcN)<sup>96</sup>, which provides an interpreter and invoices the legal aid council. Should TVcN not be able to provide an interpreter, the lawyer can engage an interpreter and receive financial reimbursement for the costs incurred. Costs incurred in legal aid proceedings are reimbursed up to a certain amount, as regulated in article 26 of the *Besluit vergoedingen rechtsbijstand 2000* (decree on compensation for legal aid)<sup>97</sup>.

---

<sup>92</sup> [http://ec.europa.eu/civiljustice/legal\\_aid/legal\\_aid\\_bel\\_en.htm](http://ec.europa.eu/civiljustice/legal_aid/legal_aid_bel_en.htm) (last accessed 4 June 2018)

<sup>93</sup> For more information, see: <https://www.rechtsbijstand.nl/over-mediation-en-rechtsbijstand/hoeveel-moetik-zelf-betalen/inkomensnormen> (last accessed 11 July 2018)

<sup>94</sup> For more information, see: <https://opendata.cbs.nl/statline/#/CBS/nl/dataset/81105ned/table?dl=CFC2> (last accessed 14 May 2018)

<sup>95</sup> <https://www.rvr.org/binaries/content/assets/rvrorg/advocaten/over-lopende-zaken/20180227-veelgestelde-vragen-en-antwoorden-tolkdiensten-def.pdf> (last accessed 11 July 2018)

<sup>96</sup> <https://www.tvcn.nl/> (last accessed 11 July 2018)

<sup>97</sup> <https://zoek.officielebekendmakingen.nl/stb-1999-580.html> (last accessed 11 July 2018); for further information see also [http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra\\_uploads/rights-suspected-persons-country\\_nl.pdf](http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/rights-suspected-persons-country_nl.pdf)

## 4 Conclusion

Sylvi Rennert, Christina Weißenböck

The aim of this report was to provide an overview of the history of law clinics, particularly in Europe, and the current situation of law clinics in Austria, Belgium, Italy, and Slovenia, complemented by a look at law clinics in the larger linguistic regions (Germany and parts of Switzerland for Austria, and the Netherlands for Belgium).

Looking at the origins of law clinics is important in order to understand different development paths of law clinics and their current situation due to heterogeneous conditions and legal systems. In the mother country of law clinics, the USA, the lack of practical training for law students and the need for free legal aid can be considered the main drivers for the development of hundreds of law clinics since the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, with a rapid expansion since the 1960s. From then on, law clinics began to spread, but did not gain ground in Europe until the 1990s. In the countries that are the subject of this report, access to legal aid has been easier, as under certain conditions, free legal aid is provided by the state. Furthermore, practical legal education is required for certain occupations, like becoming a lawyer. In Germany, legal restraints hindered the establishment of law clinics, as law students were not allowed to provide legal aid until 2008. However, growing demand for free legal help as well as for practical training has pushed the development of law clinics in the last years.

Following the definition of a law clinic as an education programme that combines the elements of legal aid and practical legal training, this report found more than 100 law clinics in the above-mentioned countries. However, only few law clinics are active in the field of criminal law. Italian universities are pioneers in this regard: Eight universities offer law clinics that include criminal law or penal law.

Very few law clinics provide interpreting services. Only one Italian law clinic (in Trieste) and some German law clinics (most of them refugee law clinics) offer interpreting services, but most of them appear to work with volunteers, and the service is not provided consistently. Some of these law clinics work with exchange students who function as interpreters, others with professional translators/interpreters, and some with non-professional volunteers. Only in the Italian law clinic do law and interpreting students work together.

All countries covered in this report have some kind of public legal aid or advice system in place, although there may be limitations regarding who can use it. While interpreting is provided in court proceedings and police interviews by professional court interpreters paid by the authorities, this is often not the case in legal aid proceedings, with the notable exception of the Netherlands. In most of the countries reviewed in this report, help by lawyers is provided for free only for an initial consultation. There are, however, various non-governmental organisations that provide free legal advice in combination with interpreting services.

Currently, law clinics are not meeting the needs of persons suspected or accused of crime in any of the countries under review. The reasons for this state of affairs include the following: Several law clinics do not offer legal aid or consultations – they are used as a means to provide education and training (on real cases), not as a means to provide a service to people in need. Many law clinics that do offer legal aid or consultations do not deal with criminal justice, and when they do, there is a limit to what students are allowed to do. Additionally, law clinics only cover a limited part of the national territory.

Therefore, persons suspected or accused of crime who do not have sufficient means to retain their own legal counsel are much more effectively served by non-profit organisations and lawyers' associations doing pro bono work.

Taking into account current (and probably future) needs of society and in order to contribute to meeting them, it would be expedient for universities to start new law clinics dealing with criminal justice or to add criminal justice to the areas covered by existing law clinics. At the same time, it would be desirable for universities to integrate the language dimension, i.e. interpreting services, into the activities and services of their law clinics to best serve the population.

In many countries, law clinics are not fully part of the university curriculum. There are currently no standards for the cooperation of law clinics and interpreting services, and there is only one university where a law clinic cooperates with interpreting students: the Refugee Law Clinic at the University of Trieste, which, however, does not cover criminal justice.

In view of the current situation, we recommend developing best-practice examples of transcultural law clinics that serve both the needs of the population with regard to criminal law and provide high-quality training for law and interpreting students.

The aim is a truly interdisciplinary approach where students of law and interpreting work together on real cases from the beginning to gain an understanding of each other's work as well as the subject matter. This requires close cooperation between different departments of the university or, in some cases, between two universities. Students should have the opportunity to work on real cases, and to gain ECTS points for the work in the law clinic. (Transcultural) law clinics should be embedded in the curriculum and supported by preparatory courses such as legal terminology, conducting (interpreter-mediated) interviews, etc.

In the next phases of the TransLaw project, the focus will be on creating the framework for setting up such transcultural law clinics at the partner universities to provide high-quality practical training for law students and interpreting students, while also improving the situation of persons suspected or accused of crime.

## 5 References

- 2176/J-XXIV. GP 2009. (2009) Anfrage des Abgeordneten Albert Steinhauser, Freundinnen und Freunde an die Bundesministerin für Justiz betreffend Rechtsambulanz.
- 2212/AB-XXIV. GP 2009. (2009) Anfragebeantwortung der Bundesministerin für Justiz zur Zahl 2176/J-XXIV. GP 2009.
- Bambust, I., Kruger, A., & Kruger, T. (2012). Constitutional and Judicial Language Protection in Multilingual States: A Brief Overview of South Africa and Belgium. *Erasmus Law Review*, 5(3), 211-232. doi:10.5553/elr221026712012005003006
- Bárdits, A., Kádár, A. K., Novoszádek, N., Simonovits, B., Szegő, D., Vince, D. (2014) *Last Among Equals. The equality before the law of vulnerable groups in the criminal justice system*. Budapest: Hungarian Helsinki Committee. Retrieved from [https://helsinki.hu/wp-content/uploads/HHC\\_Last\\_Among\\_Equals\\_2014.pdf](https://helsinki.hu/wp-content/uploads/HHC_Last_Among_Equals_2014.pdf) (last accessed 11 July 2018)
- Barendrecht, M., Kistemaker, L. Scholten, H. J., Schrader, R., Wrzesinska, M. (2014) *Legal Aid in Europe: Nine Different Ways to Guarantee Access to Justice?* Den Haag: Ministerie van Veiligheid en Justitie. Retrieved from [http://www.hiil.org/data/sitemanagement/media/Report\\_legal\\_aid\\_in\\_Europe.pdf](http://www.hiil.org/data/sitemanagement/media/Report_legal_aid_in_Europe.pdf) (last accessed 11 July 2018)
- Barry, M. M., Dubin, J. C., & Joy, P. A. (2000). Clinical Education for this Millennium: The Third Wave. *Clinical Law Review*, 7(1). Retrieved from [https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=2548228](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2548228) (last accessed 12 February 2018)
- Bartoli, C. (2015). The Italian legal clinics movement: Data and prospects. *International Journal of Clinical Legal Education*, 22(2), 213–229. doi:10.19164/ijcle.v22i2.427
- Bartoli, C. (2016). Legal clinics in Europe: for a commitment of higher education in social justice. *Diritto & questioni pubbliche special issue*. Retrieved from [http://www.dirittoquestionipubbliche.org/page/2016\\_nSE\\_Legal-clinics-in-Europe/DQ\\_2016\\_Legal-Clinics-in-Europe\\_specialissue.pdf](http://www.dirittoquestionipubbliche.org/page/2016_nSE_Legal-clinics-in-Europe/DQ_2016_Legal-Clinics-in-Europe_specialissue.pdf) (last accessed 12 February 2018)
- Bloch, F. S. (2008). Access to justice and the global clinical movement. *Washington University Journal of Law & Policy* 28(1). Retrieved from [http://openscholarship.wustl.edu/law\\_journal\\_law\\_policy/vol28/iss1/6](http://openscholarship.wustl.edu/law_journal_law_policy/vol28/iss1/6) (last accessed 12 March 2018)
- Bloch, F. S. (2011). *The Global Clinical Movement: Educating Lawyers for Social Justice*. New York: Oxford University Press. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195381146.001.0001>.
- Canestrini, N. (2017, 18 March): Legal aid in Italy. [Blog post] Retrieved from <https://canestrinilex.com/en/readings/legal-aid-in-italy/> (last accessed 03 September 2018).
- Castro-Buitrago, E., Espejo-Yaksic, N., Mariela, P., & Villarreal, M. (2011). *Clinical Legal Education in Latin America. Toward Public Interest*. In Frank S. Bloch (Ed.). New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 69–84.
- Claessens, Th. M. A., M., 't Hooft, I., Jacops, J. I. M. (1970). De balie: een leemte in de rechtshulp. *Ars Aequi*, 225–313. Retrieved from [http://arsaequi.nl/bijzondere-nummer/het\\_zwarte\\_nummer](http://arsaequi.nl/bijzondere-nummer/het_zwarte_nummer).

Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers (European Commission) (2018) *The 2018 EU justice scoreboard*. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. doi:10.2838/546593 Retrieved from [https://ec.europa.eu/info/publications/2018-eu-justice-scoreboard\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/info/publications/2018-eu-justice-scoreboard_en) (last accessed 11 July 2018)

ENCLE – European Network for Clinical Legal Education. (n. d.). *Definition of a Legal Clinic*. Retrieved from <http://encle.org/about-encle/definition-of-a-legal-clinic>.

Fessler, E. (21 June 2016). Erste Rechtshilfe für Flüchtlinge. *wissenswert Magazin der Leopold-Franzens-Universität Innsbruck, Juni 2016*, 4–5. Retrieved from <https://www.uibk.ac.at/public-relations/medien/wissenswert/> (last accessed 12 March 2018)

Georgescu, L. (2015). Die Studentische Rechtsberatung der Universität Passau e.V. *ZpR/GJLE*, 2, 123–130.

Gibens, S. (2006). Legal aid in Belgium: The absence of a tradition? *International Journal of the Legal Profession*, 13(1), 3–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09695950600598350>.

Giddings, J., Burrige, R., Shelley, A. M., & Klein, C. (2011). *The First Wave Of Modern Clinical Legal Education: The United States, Britain, Canada, And Australia*. In Frank S. Bloch (Ed.), pp. 3–23. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195381146.003.0001>.

Hannemann, J.-G. A., & Dietlein, G. (2016). *Studentische Rechtsberatung und Clinical Legal Education in Deutschland*. Berlin/Heidelberg: Springer.

Kilian, M. (2017). Klinische Juristenausbildung als Element einer modernen Juristenausbildung Warum die Nebenwirkungen und Risiken gering sind, der Gewinn für die Rechtspflege aber erheblich ist. *AnwBl*, 10/2017, 950–955.

Kilian, M., & Wenzel, L. (2017). Law Clinics in Deutschland: Zahlen, Typologien und Strukturen Mehr als 60 Law Clinics haben sich im Umfeld der juristischen Fakultäten gebildet. *AnwBl*, 10/2017, 963–965.

Kuehn, R. R., & Santacroce, D. A. (2017). *The 2016–17 Survey of Applied Legal Education. Center for the Study of Applied Legal Education (CSALE)*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan. [http://www.csale.org/files/Report\\_on\\_2016-17\\_CSALE\\_Survey.pdf](http://www.csale.org/files/Report_on_2016-17_CSALE_Survey.pdf) (last accessed 12 February 2018)

Kurt, S. (2016). *Rechtswissenschaftliche Forschung: Weg vom Papier, hin zum Menschen*. <http://blog.nccr-onthemove.ch/rechtswissenschaftliche-forschung-weg-vom-papier-hin-zum-menschen/?lang=de> (last accessed 27 February 2018)

Łomowski, D. (Ed.) (2005). *The Legal Clinics: The Idea, Organization, Methodology*. Warsaw: The Legal Clinics Foundation. Retrieved from [http://www.fupp.org.pl/down/legal\\_clinic.pdf](http://www.fupp.org.pl/down/legal_clinic.pdf) (last accessed 12 February 2018)

Luparia, L. (n. d.). “Interview with Luca Lupária”. Retrieved from <http://www.errorigiudiziari.com/luca-luparia-italy-innocence-project/> (last accessed 23 April 2018).

Malle, T. (2017): Studierende als Rechtsberater. <http://science.orf.at/stories/2826393/> (last accessed 27 February 2018)

Mathe, J. (2016). Studentische Rechtsberatung. Klinik gegen Wissenslücken. Retrieved from [https://www.wienerzeitung.at/nachrichten/wien/stadtleben/850423\\_Klinik-gegen-Wissensluecken.html](https://www.wienerzeitung.at/nachrichten/wien/stadtleben/850423_Klinik-gegen-Wissensluecken.html) (last accessed 27 February 2018)

- Mathews, R. B. & Botero, J. C. (2010). Access to Justice in the United States. Findings from the Newly Released Rule of Law Index of the World Justice Project. *VIRGINIA LAWYER* (59, December 2010), 24-25. Retrieved from [https://worldjusticeproject.org/sites/default/files/documents/access\\_to\\_justice\\_in\\_the\\_united\\_states\\_virginia\\_lawyer\\_12-10.pdf](https://worldjusticeproject.org/sites/default/files/documents/access_to_justice_in_the_united_states_virginia_lawyer_12-10.pdf)
- McCaffrey, A. (2000). Don't get lost in translation: Teaching law students to work with language interpreters. *Clinical Law Review*, 6(1).
- Meurens, N., & Mathieu, S. (2015). The right to interpretation and translation and the right to information in criminal proceedings in the EU. Country: Belgium [PDF]. Retrieved from [http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra\\_uploads/rights-suspected-persons-country\\_be.pdf](http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/rights-suspected-persons-country_be.pdf).
- Namoradze, Z. (2016, 19 October). The European Union Embraces a Common Approach to Legal Aid. [Blog post] Retrieved from <https://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/voices/european-union-embraces-common-approach-legal-aid> (last accessed 03 September 2018).
- Nwedu, C. N. (2017). Enhancing legal aid through university law school engagement: A case study of EBSU law clinic model. *International Journal of Clinical Legal Education*, 24(3), 98–121. Retrieved from <http://northumbriajournals.co.uk/index.php/ijcle/article/view/669/1068> (last accessed 12 February 2018)
- Paal, B. P. (2017). Legal Clinics als Element der universitären Juristenausbildung: Wie die Anwaltschaft von der studentischen Rechtsberatung profitieren kann. *AnwBl*, 10/2017, 956–958.
- Rekosh, E. (2005). *The development of clinical legal education: A global perspective – international experience, the history of legal clinics*. In Dariusz Łomowski (Ed.), pp. 43–51.
- Remmert, F. R. (2017): Ist der existierende Rechtsrahmen für Law Clinics ausreichend? Vorschlag für eine Regulierung der Law Clinics als Rechtsdienstleister. *AnwBl*, 10/2017, 946–949.
- Romano, M. C. (2016). *Appendix A: The history of legal clinics in the US, Europe and around the world*. In Clelia Bartoli, pp. 27–40.
- Sakowicz, A. (2005). The organizational and legal form of legal clinics. In Dariusz Łomowski (Ed.), pp. 52–57. Retrieved from [http://www.fupp.org.pl/down/legal\\_clinic.pdf](http://www.fupp.org.pl/down/legal_clinic.pdf) (last accessed 12 February 2018)
- Schäpers, G. (2017). Gibt es einen Platz für „Law Clinics“ in der Juristenausbildung? Fallorientierung des Studiums mit Leben füllen: Studierende und Praxis profitieren. *AnwBl*, 10/2017, 959–960.
- Schuyt, K., Groenendijk, K., & Sloot, B. (1976). *De weg naar het recht. Een rechtssociologisch onderzoek naar de samenhangen tussen maatschappelijke ongelijkheid en juridisch hulpverlening*. Deventer: Kluwer. Retrieved from [http://www.dbnl.org/tekst/schu069weg01\\_01/](http://www.dbnl.org/tekst/schu069weg01_01/).
- Shetty, S. (2004). Equal Justice Under the Law: Myth or Reality for Immigrants and Refugees? *Seattle Journal for Social Justice* 2(2), Article 28. Retrieved from <http://digitalcommons.law.seattleu.edu/sjsj/vol2/iss2/28> (last accessed 12 February 2018)
- Simoner, M. (2009, 19 May). Justizministerium stoppt Uni-Hilfe für Häftlinge. *DER STANDARD*. Retrieved from <https://derstandard.at/1242316151689/Justizministerium-stoppt-Uni-Hilfe-fuer-Haeftlinge> (last accessed 15 May 2018).
- Smorto, G. (Ed.) (2015). *Clinica legale. Un manuale operativo*. Palermo: Edizioni NEXT, <http://clinicalegale.it/come-funziona/> (last accessed 23 April 2018).



Soyer, R. & Hauser, S. (2007) Rechtsambulanz in der Justizanstalt Graz-Karlau. Ein Projekt des instituts für Strafrecht, Strafprozessrecht und Kriminologie an der Karl-Franzens Universität Graz – Stiftung-professur für Prävention und Strafrechtspraxis. *Journal für Strafrecht* 1/2007, 24-27.

UNODC – United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (2016) *Global Study on Legal Aid. Country Profiles*. Vienna: United Nations. Retrieved from [https://www.unodc.org/documents/justice-and-prison-reform/LegalAid/GSLA\\_-\\_Country\\_Profiles.pdf](https://www.unodc.org/documents/justice-and-prison-reform/LegalAid/GSLA_-_Country_Profiles.pdf)

Vogler, R. (2014). Unterschiede und rechtliche Problemfelder bei hochschulinterner und -externer Beratung im Rahmen einer Legal Clinic. *ZpR/GJLE* 1, 13–30.

Wilson, R. (2017). *The Global Evolution of Clinical Legal Education: More than a Method*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781139198370>.

Winkler, E. (2012). *Clinical Legal Education. A report on the concept of law clinics*. Retrieved from [http://law.handels.gu.se/digitalAssets/1500/1500268\\_law-clinic-rapport.pdf](http://law.handels.gu.se/digitalAssets/1500/1500268_law-clinic-rapport.pdf) (last accessed 12 February 2018)

Wizner, S. (2002): The Law School Clinic: Legal Education in the Interests of Justice. *Fordham Law Review* 70(5), Article 29. Retrieved from <http://ir.lawnet.fordham.edu/flr/vol70/iss5/29> (last accessed 12 February 2018)

World Justice Project (2018) *World Justice Project Rule of Law Index 2017-2018*. Washington: The World Justice Project. Retrieved from [https://worldjusticeproject.org/sites/default/files/documents/WJP-ROLI-2018-June-Online-Edition\\_0.pdf](https://worldjusticeproject.org/sites/default/files/documents/WJP-ROLI-2018-June-Online-Edition_0.pdf)

Zielinska, E. (2005). *Clinical education as a nucleus for the reform of legal education in Poland*. In Darisusz Łomowski (Ed.), pp. 14–15.

## 6 Annex

List of operating law clinics: Austria					
#	Name of law clinic	Website (and street address if available)	University, city	Legal specialisation, services provided	Multilingual
1	Consumer Law Clinic	<a href="https://vlc.univie.ac.at/clinics/consumer-law-clinic/">https://vlc.univie.ac.at/clinics/consumer-law-clinic/</a> Vienna Law Clinics Schenkenstraße 8-10 1010 Wien	University of Vienna, Vienna	Common contract law, commercial law, GTCB law, banking and insurance law, capital market law, travel law	no
2	Startup Clinic	<a href="https://vlc.univie.ac.at/clinics/startup-clinic/">https://vlc.univie.ac.at/clinics/startup-clinic/</a> Vienna Law Clinics Schenkenstraße 8-10 1010 Wien	University of Vienna, Vienna	Company law, civil law, intellectual property law, commercial law, labour law, tax law	no
3	Refugee Law Clinic	<a href="https://vlc.univie.ac.at/clinics/refugee-law-clinic/">https://vlc.univie.ac.at/clinics/refugee-law-clinic/</a> Vienna Law Clinics Schenkenstraße 8-10 1010 Wien	University of Vienna, Vienna	Asylum and asylum procedural law, settlement and residence law, administrative procedural law, administrative criminal law, civil rights, employment law, citizenship law	no
4	Legal Clinic für öffentliches Recht und Umweltrecht	<a href="https://oeffentliches-recht.uni-graz.at/de/praxisprofessuren/eisenberger/legal-clinic/">https://oeffentliches-recht.uni-graz.at/de/praxisprofessuren/eisenberger/legal-clinic/</a> Universitätsstraße 15/K3 8010 Graz	University of Graz, Graz	Public law, environmental law	no
5	Refugee Law Clinic (RLC)	<a href="https://refugee-law-clinic.uni-graz.at/de/">https://refugee-law-clinic.uni-graz.at/de/</a> Institut für Völkerrecht und internationale Beziehungen	University of Graz,	Asylum law, foreign nationals law	no

	Universitätsstraße 15/A4 8010 Graz	Graz		
--	---------------------------------------	------	--	--

List of operating law clinics: Slovenia					
#	Name of law clinic	Website (and street address if available)	University, city	Legal specialisation, services provided	Multi-lingual
1	Pravo za vse (The Law for All)	<a href="http://www.pravozavse.si/">http://www.pravozavse.si/</a>	Project in cooperation with the Faculty of Law, University of Maribor	Pro bono legal services of all kinds	no
2	Pravna klinika za begunce in tujce	<a href="http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-klinika-za-begunce-in-tujce/">http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-klinika-za-begunce-in-tujce/</a>	Faculty of Law, University of Ljubljana	Extracurricular activity for students who are offered an opportunity to experience (unpaid) practical work in the field of law and to offer legal assistance to refugees and other migrants in Slovenia	no
3	Pravna klinika za varstvo okolja	<a href="http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-klinika-za-varstvo-okolja/">http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-klinika-za-varstvo-okolja/</a>	Faculty of Law, University of Ljubljana	Extracurricular activity for students. The main aim is to broaden the students' theoretical knowledge and provide them with practical experiences in the field of national, European and international environmental law	no
4	Pravna klinika "Pravo v športu" / Legal Clinic "Law in Sport"	<a href="http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/en/extracurricular-activities/legal-clinic-law-in-sport/">http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/en/extracurricular-activities/legal-clinic-law-in-sport/</a>	Faculty of Law, University of Ljubljana	Students are familiarised with the relatively new field of law, which is becoming more and more important in (for) society	no
5	Pravna svetovalnica za varstvo pred diskriminacijo	<a href="http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-svetovalnica-za-varstvo-pred-diskriminacijo/">http://www.pf.uni-lj.si/ob-studiju/pravna-svetovalnica-za-varstvo-pred-diskriminacijo/</a>	Faculty of Law, University of Ljubljana	The aim of the anti-discrimination legal clinic is to enhance the knowledge and broaden the experiences of the participating students with regard to legal protection against discrimination and promotion of equality	no

List of operating law clinics: Italy					
#	Name of law clinic	Website (and street address if available)	University/city	Legal specialisation/services provided	Multi-lingual

1	Il diritto per strada: accesso per le persone senza fissa dimora	<a href="https://community.ict.uniba.it/dipartimenti/laboratorilex/cliniche-legali">https://community.ict.uniba.it/dipartimenti/laboratorilex/cliniche-legali</a>	Università degli Studi di Bari, Bari	Persons of no fixed abode	no
2	L'ADR a tutela dei consumatori e delle piccole imprese	<a href="https://community.ict.uniba.it/dipartimenti/laboratorilex/cliniche-legali">https://community.ict.uniba.it/dipartimenti/laboratorilex/cliniche-legali</a>	Università degli Studi di Bari, Bari	Alternative dispute resolution methods for consumers and small enterprises	no
3	Vittime, discriminazioni e diritto	<a href="https://corsi.unibo.it/magistralecu/Giurisprudenza-Bologna/law-clinics-vittime-discriminazioni-e-diritto">https://corsi.unibo.it/magistralecu/Giurisprudenza-Bologna/law-clinics-vittime-discriminazioni-e-diritto</a>	Alma Mater Studiorum – Università di Bologna, Bologna	Victims of crime and victims of discrimination	no
4	Clinica legale I	<a href="http://clinicale-gale.unibs.it/index.php/clinica-legale-i-e-ii/">http://clinicale-gale.unibs.it/index.php/clinica-legale-i-e-ii/</a>	Università degli Studi di Brescia, Brescia	Legal aid for socially disadvantaged persons, non-profit organisations, trade unions, social cooperatives, etc.	no
5	Clinica legale II	<a href="http://clinicale-gale.unibs.it/index.php/clinica-legale-i-e-ii/">http://clinicale-gale.unibs.it/index.php/clinica-legale-i-e-ii/</a>	Università degli Studi di Brescia, Brescia	Legal aid for socially disadvantaged persons, non-profit organisations, trade unions, social cooperatives, etc.	no
6	Clinica del lavoro	<a href="http://clinicale-gale.unibs.it/index.php/clinica-del-lavoro/">http://clinicale-gale.unibs.it/index.php/clinica-del-lavoro/</a>	Università degli Studi di Brescia, Brescia	Labour consulting services for entrepreneurs, non-profit organisations, social cooperatives, etc.	no
7	Coesione e diritto	<a href="http://www.lex.unict.it/it/cdl/la-clinica-legale-%E2%80%9Ccoesione-e-diritto%E2%80%9D">http://www.lex.unict.it/it/cdl/la-clinica-legale-%E2%80%9Ccoesione-e-diritto%E2%80%9D</a>	Università degli Studi di Catania, Catania	Legal aid for vulnerable groups and individuals	no
8	Clinica legale	<a href="http://www.unife.it/giurisprudenza/giurisprudenza/studiare/clinica-legale">http://www.unife.it/giurisprudenza/giurisprudenza/studiare/clinica-legale</a>	Università degli Studi di Ferrara, Ferrara	Legal aid in areas such as the protection of fundamental rights and environmental protection	no
9	I diritti dei richiedenti protezione internazionale	<a href="https://www.giurisprudenza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html">https://www.giurisprudenza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html</a>	Università degli Studi di Firenze, Florence	Asylum and asylum seekers	no
10	La protezione dei	<a href="https://www.giurisprudenza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html">https://www.giurisprudenza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html</a>	Università degli Studi	European Court of Human Rights	no

	diritti da parte della Corte Europea dei Diritti dell'Uomo	<a href="https://www.giurisprudenza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html">denza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html</a>	di Firenze, Florence		
11	La protezione dei diritti delle persone in esecuzione penale	<a href="https://www.giurisprudenza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html">https://www.giurisprudenza.unifi.it/vp-313-cliniche-legali.html</a>	Università degli Studi di Firenze, Florence	Prisons and prisoners	no
12	Immigrazione e asilo	<a href="http://giurisprudenza.unige.it/node/1167">http://giurisprudenza.unige.it/node/1167</a>	Università degli Studi di Genova, Genoa	International protection	no
13	Clinica legale in materia penale	<a href="https://www.giurisprudenza.unimib.it/it/eventi/clinica-legale-materia-penale-aa-2017-2018">https://www.giurisprudenza.unimib.it/it/eventi/clinica-legale-materia-penale-aa-2017-2018</a>	Università degli Studi di Milano Bicocca, Milan	Criminal law	no
14	Clinica legale	<a href="http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018">http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018</a>	Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Milan	Civil and commercial law	no
15	Clinica legale	<a href="http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018">http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018</a>	Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Milan	Criminal law	no
16	Clinica legale	<a href="http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018">http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018</a>	Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Milan	Administrative law	no
17	Clinica legale	<a href="http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018">http://milano.unicatt.it/corsi-di-laurea/cliniche-legali-e-tirocini-anticipati-pratica-forense-cliniche-legali-2018</a>	Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Milan	International law	no
18	Clinica legale per i diritti umani (CLEDU)	<a href="https://www.unipa.it/dipartimenti/di.gi./clinica-legale-per-i-diritti-umani/">https://www.unipa.it/dipartimenti/di.gi./clinica-legale-per-i-diritti-umani/</a>	Università degli Studi di Palermo, Palermo	Legal aid and information for migrants, unauthorised immigrants, and prisoners	no

19	Clinica legale penitenziaria	<a href="http://www.giurisprudenza.unipg.it/didattica/cliniche-legali/sportello-in-carcere">http://www.giurisprudenza.unipg.it/didattica/cliniche-legali/sportello-in-carcere</a>	Università degli Studi di Perugia, Perugia	Prisoners	no
20	Salute, ambiente e territorio	<a href="http://www.giurisprudenza.unipg.it/didattica/cliniche-legali/law-clinic-salute-ambiente-e-territorio">http://www.giurisprudenza.unipg.it/didattica/cliniche-legali/law-clinic-salute-ambiente-e-territorio</a>	Università degli Studi di Perugia, Perugia	Protection of health, the environment and landscapes at local level	no
21	Clinica legale	<a href="https://www.scienze-giuridiche.uniroma1.it/node/6116">https://www.scienze-giuridiche.uniroma1.it/node/6116</a>	Università degli Studi di Roma "La Sapienza", Rome	Work on real cases, drafting of legal documents, participation in dispute resolution or arbitration proceedings	no
22	Clinica del diritto dell'immigrazione e della cittadinanza	<a href="http://www.giur.uniroma3.it/?q=cliniche_legali">http://www.giur.uniroma3.it/?q=cliniche_legali</a>	Università Roma Tre, Rome	Migrants	no
23	Clinica legale in diritto dei minori	<a href="http://www.giur.uniroma3.it/?q=cliniche_legali">http://www.giur.uniroma3.it/?q=cliniche_legali</a>	Università Roma Tre, Rome	Minors	no
24	Clinica legale in Diritto dei risparmiatori	<a href="http://www.giur.uniroma3.it/?q=cliniche_legali">http://www.giur.uniroma3.it/?q=cliniche_legali</a>	Università Roma Tre, Rome	Savings accounts	no
25	Clinica legale carceri	<a href="http://www.giur.uniroma3.it/?q=cliniche_legali">http://www.giur.uniroma3.it/?q=cliniche_legali</a>	Università Roma Tre, Rome	Prisons	no
26	Laboratorio – clinica legale Rapporto di lavoro	<a href="https://www.unisi.it/ugov/degrecourse/235697">https://www.unisi.it/ugov/degrecourse/235697</a>	Università degli Studi di Siena, Siena		no
27	Laboratorio – clinica legale Sindacato e previdenza	<a href="https://www.unisi.it/ugov/degrecourse/235685">https://www.unisi.it/ugov/degrecourse/235685</a>	Università degli Studi di Siena, Siena		no
28	Clinica Carcere e diritti 1	<a href="http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=car-">http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=car-</a>	Università degli Studi di Torino, Turin	Prisoners, victims of trafficking, persons of no fixed abode	no

		cere_e_diritti/attivita.html			
29	Clinica Carcere e diritti 2	<a href="http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=carcere_e_diritti_2/attivita.html">http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=carcere_e_diritti_2/attivita.html</a>	Università degli Studi di Torino, Turin	Female prisoners, Guide to Prisoners' Rights	no
30	Clinica disabilità	<a href="http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=disabilita/attivita.html">http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=disabilita/attivita.html</a>	Università degli Studi di Torino, Turin	Disabled persons and discrimination	no
31	Human Rights and Migration Law Clinic	<a href="http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=human/attivita.html">http://clinichelegali.campusnet.unito.it/do/home.pl/View?doc=human/attivita.html</a>	Università degli Studi di Torino, Turin	Migrants and asylum seekers	no
32	Refugee Law Clinic	<a href="https://iuislit.units.it/sites/iuislit.units.it/files/Refugee%20Law%20Clinic%20-%20descrizione%20DEF2.pdf">https://iuislit.units.it/sites/iuislit.units.it/files/Refugee%20Law%20Clinic%20-%20descrizione%20DEF2.pdf</a> <a href="https://de-de.facebook.com/rlCTS/">https://de-de.facebook.com/rlCTS/</a>	Università degli Studi di Trieste, Trieste	Asylum seekers	yes
33	Clinica legale	<a href="http://www.dsg.univr.it/?ent=avviso&amp;dest=&amp;id=128545&amp;lang=it">http://www.dsg.univr.it/?ent=avviso&amp;dest=&amp;id=128545&amp;lang=it</a>	Università degli Studi di Verona, Verona	Civil procedure	no
34	Clinica legale	<a href="http://www.dsg.univr.it/?ent=avviso&amp;dest=&amp;id=128545&amp;lang=it">http://www.dsg.univr.it/?ent=avviso&amp;dest=&amp;id=128545&amp;lang=it</a>	Università degli Studi di Verona, Verona	Criminal procedure	no

List of operating law clinics: Belgium					
#	Name of law clinic	Website (and street address if available)	University, city	Legal specialisation, services provided	Multi-lingual
1	Law Clinic	<a href="https://www.law.kuleuven.be/education/clinics/clinics-on-eu-law-2017-2018/foi-clinics-17-18-005.pdf">https://www.law.kuleuven.be/education/clinics/clinics-on-eu-law-2017-2018/foi-clinics-17-18-005.pdf</a> Tiensestraat 41 box 3413 3000 Leuven	KU Leuven, Leuven and Brussels	EU and economic Law, EU and human rights law, EU in international relations, case law	no
2	None ("legal clinic" globally mentioned as part of the LL.M)	<a href="https://www.uantwerpen.be/en/education/education-and-training/master-of-laws/profile/">https://www.uantwerpen.be/en/education/education-and-training/master-of-laws/profile/</a> Stadscampus-Building V Venusstraat 23 2000 Antwerp	University of Antwerp, Antwerp	General, no mention of legal clinic linked to specific legal specialisation	no

	programme)				
3	ELC (Equality Law Clinic)	<a href="http://www.philo-droit.be/-ELC-?lang=en">http://www.philo-droit.be/-ELC-?lang=en</a> Perelman Centre for Legal Philosophy and the European Law Centre of ULB F.D. Rooseveltlaan 50, 1050 Brussels	Université libre de Bruxelles, Brussels	Immigration and asylum law, reproductive justice and abortion rights, transgender rights, disability rights	no
4	Human Rights and Migration Law Clinic	<a href="http://www.hrc.ugent.be/human-rights-and-migration-law-clinic">http://www.hrc.ugent.be/human-rights-and-migration-law-clinic</a> Human Rights Centre Ghent University Universiteitsraat 4 9000 Gent	University of Gent, Ghent	Changes on a yearly basis; for 2017–2018: anti-discrimination law, migration law	no

List of operating law clinics: the Netherlands					
#	Name of law clinic	Website (and street address if available)	University, city	Legal specialisation, services provided	Multi-lingual
1	Law shop (wetwinkel)	<a href="http://www.wetwinkelamsterdam.nl/english/">http://www.wetwinkelamsterdam.nl/english/</a> Roetersstraat 23 1018 WB Amsterdam	Wetswinkel Amsterdam, Amsterdam	Rent issues, labour law, consumer rights, administrative law, and other civil issues; no criminal cases	no
2	Maastricht Mediation Clinic	<a href="https://www.maastrichtuniversity.nl/aboutum/faculties/law/education/moot-courts-and-clinics/clinical-education/maastricht-mediation">https://www.maastrichtuniversity.nl/aboutum/faculties/law/education/moot-courts-and-clinics/clinical-education/maastricht-mediation</a> Maastricht University Faculty of Law PO Box 616 6200 MD Maastricht	Maastricht University, Maastricht	Mediators-in-training	no
3	CSR (Corporate social responsibility) – Lab	<a href="https://www.maastrichtuniversity.nl/aboutum/faculties/law/education/moot-courts-and-clinics/clinical-education/corporate-social">https://www.maastrichtuniversity.nl/aboutum/faculties/law/education/moot-courts-and-clinics/clinical-education/corporate-social</a> Maastricht University Faculty of Law PO Box 616 6200 MD Maastricht	Maastricht University, Maastricht	Corporate social responsibility in practice and the implementation of social pledges	no
4	Amsterdam International Law Clinic	<a href="http://ailc.uva.nl/">http://ailc.uva.nl/</a> P.O. Box 1030 1000 BA Amsterdam <a href="mailto:int-eulaw-fdr@uva.nl">int-eulaw-fdr@uva.nl</a>	University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam	Public international law and European law + the Amsterdam Center for International Law	no
5	Clinic Law	<a href="https://clinic.nl/about-">https://clinic.nl/about-</a>	University	Intellectual property law,	no



	Incubator	<a href="http://clinic/?lang=en">clinic/?lang=en</a> <a href="mailto:info@clinic.nl">info@clinic.nl</a> (Clinic cannot be reached by phone, by fax or by post)	of Amsterdam, Amsterdam	brand law, trademark law, patent law, database law, design law, telecommunications law, internet law, information law, IT law, consumer law	
6	Utrecht School of Law Clinical Programme on Conflict, Human Rights and International Justice	<a href="http://www.asser.nl/upload/documents/642010_12142Flyer%20Utrecht%20Law%20School%20Clinical%20Programme.pdf">http://www.asser.nl/upload/documents/642010_12142Flyer%20Utrecht%20Law%20School%20Clinical%20Programme.pdf</a> (website not available, only wikipedia and pdf) Utrecht University School of Law Drift 153512 BR Utrecht	Utrecht School of Law, Utrecht	International law, international criminal law and human rights law	no
7	International Humanitarian Law Clinic (IHL Clinic)	<a href="https://studiegids.leidenuniv.nl/courses/show/76761/international-humanitarian-law-clinic">https://studiegids.leidenuniv.nl/courses/show/76761/international-humanitarian-law-clinic</a> Steenschuur 25 2311 ES Leiden	Leiden University, Leiden	Procedural and substantive law, international humanitarian law	no
8	Law Clinics	<a href="https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/nl/studenten/studie/aanvullend-onderwijs/law-clinics/">https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/nl/studenten/studie/aanvullend-onderwijs/law-clinics/</a> Warandelaan 2 5037 AB Tilburg	Tilburg University, Tilburg	Criminal justice, international business taxation and human rights law	no
9	TILT Clinic	<a href="https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/research/institutes-and-research-groups/tilt/education/clinics/">https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/research/institutes-and-research-groups/tilt/education/clinics/</a> Warandelaan 2 5037 AB Tilburg	Tilburg Institute for Law, Technology, and Society (TILT), Tilburg	Cooperation between Louwers IP/Technology Lawyers and four students regarding the privacy implications of health and lifestyle monitoring wearables	no